



**USAID**  
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

**AFGHANISTAN**

## FINAL PERFORMANCE EVALUATION (OCTOBER-NOVEMBER 2014)

### LAND REFORM IN AFGHANISTAN (LARA) PROJECT



NOVEMBER 2014

This report was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID). It was prepared under contract with Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc. for USAID's Afghanistan "Services under Program and Project Offices for Results Tracking Phase II" (SUPPORT II) project.

## **Activity Signature Page**

This report was contracted under USAID Contract Number: AID-306- C-12-00012.  
Afghanistan Services Under Program and Project Office for Results Tracking Phase II  
(SUPPORT II).

This Activity was initiated by the Office of Program and Project Development (OPPD)  
through Mr. Daryl Martyris, COR/SUPPORT II.

### **Assignment Title:**

**Team Leader:** Allen Decker

**Team Members:** Michel Brunet  
Abdul Basir Malikzai  
Mohammad Arif Niazi  
Mussarat Arif Momand

**Activity Start Date:** October 14, 2014

**Completion Date:** November 24, 2014

**Michael Lechner, Chief of Party**

**Waheed Ahmadi, Deputy Chief of Party**

Checchi and Company Consulting, Inc.

Kabul, Afghanistan

### **Disclaimer:**

The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID, the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, or any other organization or person associated with this project.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Executive Summary.....	1
1. PROJECT BACKGROUND.....	1
2. EVALUATION QUESTIONS, DESIGN, METHODS AND LIMITATIONS.....	1
3. RECOMMENDATIONS.....	5
4. CONCLUSIONS.....	5
II. Introduction.....	6
1. PROJECT BACKGROUND.....	6
2. EVALUATION PURPOSE.....	6
3. EVALUATION QUESTIONS.....	7
4. METHODOLOGY.....	8
III. Findings.....	10
IV. Conclusions.....	18
V. Recommendations.....	22
Annex I: Scope of Work.....	26
Annex II: Workplan.....	37
Annex III: Bibliography of Documents Reviewed.....	43
Annex IV: Schedule of Meetings.....	47
Annex V: Data Collection Instruments.....	49
Annex VI: Detailed Meeting Notes (Consolidated).....	58

## ACRONYMS

ACSF	Afghan Civil Society Forum
AGCHO	Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office
AIMS	Afghanistan Information Management Systems
AIHRC	Afghanistan Independent Human Right Commission
ALCBO	Afghan Land and Capacity-Building Organization
ALCO	Afghan Land Consulting Organization
ALRMIS	Arazi Land Records Management Information System
API	Application Programming Interface
APPF	Afghanistan Public Protection Force
Arazi	Afghanistan Land Authority
BAA	Business Area Analysis
BizCLIR	Business Climate Legal and Institutional Reform
CAP	Community Action Plan
CBDR	Community-based Dispute Resolution
CDC	Community Development Councils
CDMS	Cadastral Data Management System
COP	Chief of Party
COR	Contracting Officer's Representative
CLIR	Commercial Law and Intuitional Reform
DCEO	Deputy Chief Executive Officer
DCOP	Deputy Chief of Party
DEC	Development Experience Clearinghouse
DFID	United Kingdom's Department for International Development
DRACS	Deeds Registry Archive Conversion System
DS	Automated Directives System
dTS	Development and Training Services, Inc.
DUDA	Department of Urban Development Affairs
FY	Fiscal Year
GIRoA	Government Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
GIS	Geographic Information System
GPS	Geographic Positioning System
GRM	Government Revenue Management
Harakat	Afghan Investment Climate Facility Organization; an NGO
IT	Information Technology
KCI	Kabul City Initiative
KURP	Kabul Urban Reconstruction Project
IDLG	Independent Directorate of Local Governance
ILS	International Land Systems

LAL	Land Acquisition Law
LALTF	Land Acquisition Law Task Force
LARA	Land Reform in Afghanistan
LML	Land Management Law
LRMP	Land Records Modernization Project
LTER	Land Tenure and Economic Restructuring in Afghanistan
MAIL	Ministry of Agriculture, Irrigation, and Livestock
MCIT	Ministry of Communication and Information Technology
MOJ	Ministry of Justice
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MOWA	Ministry of Women’s Affairs
MUD	Ministry of Urban Development Affairs
NGA	National Geospatial Agency
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PIA	Public Information Awareness
PIL	Partner Implementation Letters
PMP	Performance Management Plan
RAMP-UP	Regional Afghan Municipalities Program for Urban Populations
SDK	Software Development Kit
SMAP	Strategic Municipal Action Plan
SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
SOW	Scope of Work/ Statement of Work
SUPPORT	Services Under Program and Project Offices for Results Tracking
SWOT	Analysis Based on Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Time
UNDP/ASGP	United Nations Development Program’s Afghanistan Subnational Governance
USG	United States Government
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WBI	World Bank Institute
WLRTF	Women Land Rights Task Force

## **I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### **1. PROJECT BACKGROUND**

This report analyzes the findings of the final performance evaluation of USAID's Land Reform in Afghanistan Project (LARA). Tetra Tech ARD implemented the project in two phases, from January 2011 to February 2014, and received a no-cost extension from February 2014 to November 2014. Covering the entire timeframe of LARA, the purpose of this evaluation is to learn the extent to which the project achieved its objectives and goals, document the project's successes and weaknesses, and develop recommendations to inform USAID on the feasibility of supporting land reform initiatives across its Afghanistan programs.

LARA was intended to support the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIROA) in the implementation of the National Land Policy by developing a robust, enduring, Afghan- owned and -managed land market framework that encourages investment and growth, mitigates land-based conflict, and builds confidence in the government's legitimacy, thereby enhancing stability in Afghan society. LARA was designed to contribute to USAID's Assistance Objective (AO) 4 and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy (ANDS), specifically two National Priority Programs: Agriculture and Rural Development, and Urban Management Support Program. The project had the following objectives:

- Improve property rights delivery (land administration and formalization).
- Enable all citizens (including women, minorities, and vulnerable populations) to exercise their rights through public information awareness.
- Strengthen land dispute resolution processes to reduce conflict and promote peace and stability.
- Strengthen institutional, policy, and legal reform to secure property rights for Afghan citizens.
- Provide assistance in the cross-cutting areas of gender, training, public information awareness, and private sector development.

In accordance with the Scope of Work, the evaluation focuses on eight questions, outlined below in terms of priority. The Evaluation Team's findings immediately follow each question.

### **2. EVALUATION QUESTIONS, DESIGN, METHODS AND LIMITATIONS**

#### **Systems & Sustainability**

- 1. Have the land management/administrative system upgrades improved functionality for Arazi? If so, how? If not, what were the obstacles?*

The system upgrades improved the functionality of Arazi in a number of ways. Most importantly, LARA upgraded Arazi as the major land agency of Afghanistan, strengthened its leadership, and integrated the cadastral unit formerly located in the Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office (AGCHO) into the agency. The plan is to make Arazi responsible for formalization and other land titling, based on the integrated cadastral database, Arazi Land Records Management Information System (ALRMIS).

Obstacles to Arazi's functioning include the incomplete training of its staff, the incomplete extension of its central office systems to its divisional offices, and the absence of a detailed strategic plan to survey and title the vast number of rural and urban land parcels in the country. Furthermore, Arazi's new responsibilities are not fully understood by agencies working in the area of land reform. Finally, Arazi does not have a financial model that will sustain its operation without donor support and budgetary support.

*2. What are the perceptions of the officials and staff of the advantages/disadvantages of the new systems?*

Arazi staff believes the organization has an enhanced leadership with a solid strategic plan. It has shed the legacy of the AGCHO and has reformed its adopted cadastral unit. Furthermore, Arazi staff is highly motivated, but are not fully cognizant of their still limited ability to perform their tasks on a nationwide basis. The staff perception is that the revisions to ALRMIS must be made to enable them to use the system. Regarding disadvantages, the Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA), Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG), and other GIRoA entities do not have a clear idea of what Arazi has done or is supposed to do. There is still ignorance concerning AGCHO's current role and its changed relationship to Arazi.

*3. How will Arazi maintain the systems and sustain operational efficiency and scaling once LARA assistance is completed?*

Now that LARA assistance is complete, Arazi will have to secure ALRMIS as a functioning cadastral system. Although there was earlier training on the ALRMIS system, training with the software appears to have ceased in the absence of completing revisions to the data fields and processes. Arazi has to expand its strategy to include a program of nationwide formalization and registration. One way to do so is to hire private contractors to complete the surveying work. Furthermore, Arazi must expand new systems to its divisional offices.

Arazi's planned training institute will need to augment its capacity and methodology beyond those of its LARA mentor. A significant challenge will be how to scale up the production of surveyed property parcels and establish them on the path to securing deeds of title. To date, Arazi leadership has focused on establishing the organization and hiring and training staff in basic functions. These are important achievements, but they will have to be supplemented by extending the operational strategy to broaden operations to other cities or even nationally.

## **Upgrading and Formalization**

4. *What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements model developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad? Are there opportunities for replicating this model in other cities of Afghanistan?*

The Evaluation Team found that LARA's work in formalization and upgrading was brought to a successful conclusion in cooperation with the Jalalabad mayor's office, the local IDLG unit, and Community Development Councils. Upgrading work involved mainly road and drainage ditch construction, and significantly included community dispute resolution mechanisms.

Twenty-five percent of parcels were actually registered and received deeds of title; an equal number were recognized as having customary title. In all, 2,780 parcels were surveyed in the two pilot areas. Most importantly, property rights of the parcel holder were formally recognized in the form of a tax book (*tasfia*). The result is that nearly every property holder is on track leading to a formal deed of title. It is both a strength and weakness that a private sector surveying firm, not the Arazi staff, was involved in the project. Arazi was given the results and model. Women's councils were involved, but with minor or no impact.

Assuming that Arazi's role in formalization will be recognized by its related GIROA bodies, the LARA model for formalization is readily adaptable in the majority of the informal settlements that exist in every large city of Afghanistan. The whole city of Jalalabad is already mapped. Kabul is also an obvious starting point, where there are already efforts at formalization (e.g. the Kabul Urban Reconstruction, or KURP, project).

### **Capacity Building:**

5. *How are the trainees using the skills they gained from the LARA-sponsored training?*

LARA reported extensive training, both internally and with partner ministries. In the final project report, LARA describes its staff as having received tens of weeks of hands-on training, specifically on the use of standard survey equipment. Most participants in LARA training reported they are using their new skills in daily work. This is questionable, however, for the reasons explained below.

When the Evaluation Team requested agendas, lists of participants, and copies of training materials and evaluations, it was told that they are unavailable because they are in the process of being shipped to the contractor's home office. Few digital copies of training materials were ever received despite multiple requests. When the Evaluation Team asked training participants for the materials, it found the training was usually undocumented, or poorly documented, using equipment manuals or simple overviews.



In addition, the team found that in most instances LARA failed to conduct training needs assessments and provide concrete training materials that could be used by participants for subsequent or independent study of the subject matter. Training evaluations were perfunctory, if conducted at all. This is a critical problem in view of the significant continuing need for training within Arazi and with other stakeholders.

Arazi's Kabul staff has good morale, but its performance remains untested. Arazi needs to augment its training capacity to include effective workshops in community-based dispute resolution (CBDR), gender guidelines in inheritance and land ownership, and operation of the revised ALRMIS software system. All of this must include advanced training of effective trainers, development of training materials that can be used both during workshops and online and critical evaluation of results, both immediately after training sessions and in the longer term in their workplace. Arazi needs extensive additional capacity development within its Kabul staff and in its regional offices, where the training has hardly begun.

## **Sector Impact & Way Forward**

### *6. How did LARA affect the land market framework that encourages economic growth?*

In its two pilot projects in Jalalabad, LARA demonstrated how formalization of informal settlements can be accomplished and has established a road map for doing so throughout the country. LARA and Arazi's legal team worked with MUDA and IDLG to revise drafts of the Land Management Law and Land Acquisition Law that are currently before the Parliament for adoption. The Evaluation Team's legal specialists judged the draft amendments to be well-conceived and likely to be adopted when the Parliament passes the laws. The fate of the Anti-Land Grabbing Law, however, remains to be determined; it has been passed by the lower chamber of Parliament, but remains in the upper chamber.

As a result, LARA's legislative and formalization work significantly contributes to the development of the real property market, which underlies economic growth and social stabilization.

## **Gender and Outreach**

### *7. How has awareness of women's land rights and inheritance changed as a result of LARA's public information campaigns?*

The Evaluation Team found that LARA's public information campaign, mainly centered on billboards posted in Kabul and radio events in some rural areas, resulted in a modest increase in the awareness of women's land and inheritance rights (as opined by the LARA chief of party, but not observed by the Evaluation Team). Commendably, LARA also published and distributed illustrated booklets on women's inheritance rights. An independent study of the impact of LARA's media campaign documented recognition and public criticism of the campaign, but was unable to document widespread impact or resultant change in behavior.

8. *What were the results of LARA sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?*

LARA was able to document 72 instances of Afghan women inquiring about or seeking their land rights in response to the awareness campaign. This also generated several success stories and positive coverage in a Washington D.C.-based web newspaper. However, informants said that the public awareness campaign could have attained greater results in Afghanistan if it had been more direct in its message, more appealing to an Afghan audience, and given much wider dissemination, especially in rural areas and villages.

### **3. RECOMMENDATIONS**

To ensure Arazi's future success, the Evaluation Team recommends that it should:

- Recast the Arazi training center into a robust Cadastral Training Institute;
- Develop private sector appraisers, surveyors, and real property brokerage professions;
- Extend Arazi gender development and action plans to all Arazi district offices and to other GIRoA ministries and organizations;
- Utilize presidential and cabinet leadership to secure the passage and implementation of the proposed land legislation;
- Accelerate and simplify the titling process from a judicial to an administrative process, allowing a one-time granting of title deeds to all rural and urban parcel holders that have no competing claims to their property, no involvement in land grabbing, who have paid their taxes, and whose property has been in the ALMIS database for five years; and,
- Separate management of formalization and upgrading in order to focus all available resources on formalization and to use fees and taxes related to registration to fund upgrading of infrastructure in informal communities.

### **4. CONCLUSIONS**

To fulfill its potential, Arazi must at a minimum implement the ALRMIS cadastral system and implement a strategic plan for nationwide formalization and titling in both urban and rural land. If it does not do so, it could become another redundant governmental agency and a failed initiative. In its pilot communities, LARA demonstrated in an initial, partial road to stable property ownership. Most importantly, by mentoring and assisting Arazi's emergence, LARA has created an agent for continuing the reform of the Afghan real property market. Arazi should provide leadership and a working example of a progressive, effective, and non-corrupt administration. Arazi has great potential—and equally great risk. By creating a road to real property ownership, the possibility for promoting both domestic and international direct investment and enhancing general economic productivity is immense. Secure tenure allows the property market to take off. It can also significantly mitigate conflict in land ownership, as well as legitimate the government.

## **II. INTRODUCTION**

### **1. PROJECT BACKGROUND**

USAID's Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) project focused on formalizing and upgrading infrastructure in two informal settlements in the city of Jalalabad in Nangarhar province. LARA was designed to promote a legal environment conducive to the development and stabilization of the land market, and to develop a reformed system of land registration and titling.

The LARA contract was signed with Tetra Tech ARD on January 30, 2011 and was scheduled to take place in two phases, each approximately 18 months in duration: the base period (January 2011 – July 2012) and the option period (August 2012 – February 2014). A no-cost extension period was also granted from February 2014 until November 2014. This final performance evaluation covers the entire timeframe of the project, January 2011 until November 2014.

Project Implementation Letters (PILs) were signed with the Ministry of Urban Development (MUDA), the Independent Directorate for Local Government (IDLG), the Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office (AGCHO), and the Afghan Land Authority (Arazi) for joint work in urban policy, local government development, and cadastral surveying, respectively.

At the outset of the program, USAID cut funding from \$69.2 million to \$41.8 million. Subsequently, LARA experienced administrative turmoil and a succession of four chiefs of party. The project was shifted from working with the original GIRoA partners to focusing on the Jalalabad pilot settlements, Araban and Campoona, and the Afghan Land Agency (Arazi), which was it recast to include the cadastral division of AGCHO. At its mid-term evaluation, LARA was significantly behind in achieving its original objectives. The project lagged in formalizing and upgrading the two settlements, was behind in its training program, and had not completed physical improvements and provision of IT equipment and software to its counterparts. During the option and no-cost extension periods of the project, however, it attained most of its objectives.

### **2. EVALUATION PURPOSE**

The purpose of this evaluation is to learn the extent to which the LARA project achieved its objectives and goals, document the project's successes and weaknesses, and develop recommendations to inform USAID management of the feasibility of supporting land reform initiatives across its Afghanistan programs.

The evaluation's recommendations are intended to inform:

- The World Bank and others on the outstanding institutional capacity building needs within Arazi;
- GIRA stakeholders of the possibilities for replicating the model of upgrading and formalization of informal settlement developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad; and
- USAID/Afghanistan on recommendations for future assistance in the Afghan land reform process.

### **3. EVALUATION QUESTIONS**

The Evaluation Team's Scope of Work specified that the questions to answer, in order of priority, are as follows:

#### **Systems & Sustainability:**

1. Have the land management/administrative system upgrades improved functionality for Arazi? If so, how? If not, what were the obstacles?
2. What are the perceptions of the officials and staff of the advantages/disadvantages of the new systems?
3. How will Arazi maintain the systems and sustain operational efficiency and scaling once LARA assistance is completed?

#### **Upgrading and Formalization:**

4. What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements model developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad? Are there opportunities for replicating this model in other cities of Afghanistan?

#### **Capacity Building:**

5. How are the trainees using the skills they gained from the LARA-sponsored training?

#### **Sector Impact & Way Forward:**

6. How did LARA affect the land market framework that encourages economic growth?

#### **Gender and outreach:**

7. How has awareness of women's land rights and inheritance changed as a result of LARA's public information campaigns?
8. What were the results of LARA sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?

The answers to these questions are documented in the Findings section below.

#### 4. METHODOLOGY

The Evaluation Team utilized varied and flexible approaches for data collection and analysis. From the LARA project itself and USAID, the team gathered and reviewed the following:

##### **Program document review**

- a) LARA Scope of Work and its revisions
- b) LARA work plans
- c) All quarterly reports
- d) All annual reports
- e) Current PMP and other M&E documents
- f) The midterm evaluation report
- g) All training materials that could be gathered from either LARA, Arazi, or GIRoA counterparts
- h) Published program reports and trip reports and their related exhibits
- i) Guidelines and handbooks relating to LARA activities

In addition, the Evaluation Team read reports and other related documents found online, and conducted the following primary research:

##### **Interviews and consultations conducted with key informants:**

- a) Consultations with USAID/Afghanistan's Office of Economic Growth Initiative staff;
- b) Two meetings with the Deputy Mayor of Jalalabad and four municipal officials in Jalalabad;
- c) Three interviews with the Chief Executive Officer and Operations Director of ARAZI, 5 meetings with three 4 ARAZI Cadastre staff to discuss the application of the ALRMIS software, and two meetings with ARAZI legal staff and one IT/GIS specialist from LARA;
- d) One meeting with the Deputy Director, Department of Urban Development Affairs (DUDA) in Jalalabad;
- e) One meeting with the General Director and Assistant Director, Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG);
- f) Two interviews with two members of the Supreme Court in Jalalabad;
- g) Interview with UN Habitat staff, who conducted the formalization project;
- h) Interviews with implementing partner staff in Kabul;
- i) Interviews with private contractors hired by LARA;
- j) Two interviews with the Director of the Survey Department, and a Professor of GIS/GPS at Kabul Polytechnic University;
- k) One interview with the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) Technical and Policy Deputy, and one meeting with the Head of the Afghan Women's Network in Kabul; and
- l) One meeting with the Policy and Planning Chief Executive, Afghan Geodesy & Cartography Office (AGCHO).

## **Focus group discussions**

Where possible the Evaluation Team facilitated focus group discussions and conducted surveys or individual interviews with the following groups:

- a) Three focus group discussions with 22 ARAZI staff, including nine female trainees and staff members to understand the implementation of their IT systems and training within ARAZI, and their understanding of ARAZI's role;
  - b) One focused group discussion with six women from the Campoona settlement in Jalalabad, and seven residents of Araban settlement in Jalalabad, to understand their experiences and perceptions of the impact and value of LARA formalization and upgrading work; and
  - c) Eleven members of the Araban community development council (CDC) and eight members of the Campoona CDC, to gather their input regarding working with the LARA project.
- 
- a) Trainees in partner GIRoA organizations as a means of understanding their experiences and perceptions of the usefulness of the training and capacity development efforts;

## **Team roles**

In the conduct of our evaluation, the expatriate expert on survey and cadaster took the lead responsibility for work on registration, surveying, and strategies for sustaining their results. The team leader and a local national were responsible for analysis of LARA's training and capacity development work. A local legal specialist gathered and analyzed all legislative and regulatory drafts and sought to ascertain their potential for implementation. The third, part-time local specialist and the team leader were responsible for LARA's gender work. In most instances, interviews and meetings were conducted by the full Evaluation Team, or by pairing an expat with a local specialist. Interviews or focus group discussions with residents of informal settlements were led in Pashto or Dari by local consultants. The entire Evaluation Team traveled to Jalalabad to conduct its investigation there.

## **Limitations**

The Evaluation Team worked under the following handicaps:

- Unavailability of extensive training materials;
- Not being able to reassemble many of the participants in earlier LARA trainings;
- Rivalries and resentments among the various organizations originally designated as LARA partners; and,
- A lack of access to various project counterparts due to security threats during the Evaluation Team's trip to Jalalabad.

Since LARA had completed, or was in the process of shutting down the project, measures had to be taken to mitigate the severe lack of access to training materials and documentation.

This meant ferreting facts and training materials out of consultant trip reports and interviewing any available participants in trainings or workshops conducted by LARA. This was often difficult, since many participants were not available, or were dispersed to other posts. Despite these limitations, the Evaluation Team believes that it was able to assemble the preponderance of facts necessary to conduct an objective analysis of the LARA project's activities, achievements, and shortfalls.

### **III. FINDINGS**

The Evaluation Team's findings are organized according to the eight questions specified in the revised Scope of Work (SOW).

#### **Systems & Sustainability**

- 1. Have the land management/administrative system upgrades improved functionality for Arazi? If so, how? If not, what were the obstacles?*

Up to the mid-term evaluation, the institutional stakeholders in the LARA project, including MUDA, the Directorate of Urban Development Affairs (DUDA) in Jalalabad, IDLG, Arazi, AGCHO, and the Superior Court had been actively involved in policy dialogue to formalize procedures that would recognize the rights of people living in informal settlements and provide a model for upgrading infrastructure in the Araban and Campoona settlements.

By the end of the project, the coordination with MUDA that was supposed to take place had not materialized, and the cohesion between the stakeholders was weakened. A greater emphasis was directed to Arazi, the new Land Authority in Afghanistan. Although the other stakeholders were invited to a closeout session, they said they had no voice in the Arazi's role during the no-cost extension.

LARA's most significant reforms to Afghanistan's land management and administration were upgrading Arazi and bringing the cadastral unit formerly located in AGCHO under its authority. The plan was to position Arazi as the leading land agency with responsibility for formalizing and other land titling based on the Arazi Land Records Management Information System (ALRMIS), an integrated cadastral database that would also serve the land policy and administrative functions of MUDA, IDLG, and related municipalities.

LARA planned to back organizational reform with extensive staff training and a strategic plan to direct Arazi's work, under the direction of LARA's new Chief Executive Officer, Jawad Peikar. President Ashraf Ghani selected Peikar, who was educated in the U.S., to head the agency. The strategic plan has been completed. The staff training is ongoing and has been heavily oriented towards unstructured, hands-on training in GPS and survey equipment use.

Beyond assisting Arazi, LARA worked with its ministerial partners and the private sector, which improved their ability to work with Arazi to carry out its own organizational mandate.

As a carryover from its original work plan, LARA made physical upgrades to MUDA, DUDA/Jalalabad, the Jalalabad Municipality, AGCHO, and the Jalalabad Supreme Court offices. These were incomplete at the mid-term of the project. However, along with promised software and hardware, they were provided by the end of the project, thereby fulfilling LARA's commitments. LARA also upgraded the classroom of the geodesy and land survey department of Kabul Polytechnic University.

LARA employed private sector companies to handle much of the early training for MUDA and IDLG, do construction work in Campoona and Araban, and conduct the social and property surveys in the informal communities. This was important because Arazi itself did not have the required, skilled staff to conduct the formalization work. The contractor provided Arazi with a model of public-private sector cooperation, which points the way for Arazi to accomplish its future work by contracting out and supervising its high-volume survey work.

Obstacles to Arazi's operations include the incomplete training of its staff, its yet incomplete extension of central office systems to divisional offices, and the absence of a detailed strategic plan to survey and title the vast number of rural and urban land parcels in the country. Furthermore, Arazi does not yet have a financial model that will sustain its operation without donor and budgetary support.

*2. What are the perceptions of the officials and staff of the advantages/disadvantages of the new systems?*

The Cadastral Department at Arazi was not consulted in the procedures for the urban survey of the informal settlements in Jalalabad. Not having seen the results of those surveys, Arazi staff does not know if the data can be incorporated into the National Cadastral Framework. It is alarming that the only organization that deals with the cadastre in Afghanistan was not consulted on this project. The evaluation team confirmed that the results of the surveys in Jalalabad are with the Municipality of Jalalabad, but not with Arazi or AGCHO. This imbroglio will have to be resolved, and the Cadastral Department at Arazi needs to participate in all steps of future surveys on informal settlements and providing procedures and regulations. The pilot projects in Jalalabad have to be included in the national cadastral framework in Afghanistan, otherwise these projects would have been done in vain.

Arazi's self-perception is that it has an enhanced leadership with a solid strategic plan. It has shed the legacy of the cadastral survey organization (AGCHO) and reformed its adopted cadastral unit. Furthermore, it has a highly motivated staff. Our evaluation observed in each of our interactions with them that this is true. Yet MUDA, IDLG and other GIRoA entities do not have a clear idea of what Arazi has done or is supposed to do. There is still ignorance concerning AGCHO's current role and relationship to Arazi. Although Arazi's role is not yet understood by MUDA and IDLG and is resented by AGCHO, it is likely to secure recognition when it produces results.



Because of its role in the production of topographical maps and ortho-photo, AGCHO should be wholly incorporated within Arazi in the future. It is not entirely clear why this amalgamation did not take place and only the Cadastral Department became part of Arazi. The production of orthographic photos will be an essential document in the survey of informal settlements in the near future, and for that reason alone the services rendered by AGCHO should be part of Arazi.

3. *How will Arazi maintain the systems and sustain operational efficiency and scaling once LARA assistance is completed?*

Now that LARA assistance is complete, Arazi will have to secure ALRMIS as a functioning land registration software. Although there was earlier training on the ALRMIS system, training with the software appears to have ceased in the absence of completing revisions to the data fields and processes. The staff perception is that revisions to ALRMIS must be made before they are able to use the system. This stalemate requires a resolution, although nothing is currently being done to make these revisions. This is a significant problem that requires attention.

Arazi has not yet expanded its strategic plan from building the organization to a program of nationwide formalization and registration. It has trained its staff in surveying and is aware of the potential to augment their work with the help of private sector surveyors, but it does not appear to see contracting them as necessary. Furthermore, as a new organization, Arazi remains highly centralized and has not yet expanded its new systems to divisional offices. They continue to operate on the unreformed basis of business as usual, which is generally not well regarded.

In view of its current and future training needs, Arazi has organized an internal training group. The executive director recognizes that it needs to be upgraded into a training institute with an expanded capacity and greater capabilities, but this goal is not yet attained. This planned training institute will need to augment its methodologies beyond those of its LARA mentor.

Arazi's significant challenge will be how to scale up its production of surveyed property parcels and establish them on the path to securing deeds of title. To date, Arazi leadership has focused on establishing the organization and hiring and training staff in basic functions (IT, procurement, GIS and GPS training, day-to-day management, construction of its office, drafts for revisions of key legislation, and construction of its strategic plan). These are important achievements, but they will have to be supplemented by extending the operational strategy to operate nationally.

Arazi can gain capacity if the Cadastral Department is upgraded in its understanding of new technology that pertains to rural and urban surveys. As a precondition for scaling up the formalization process, the Department will have to be upgraded in the administration and management of the cadastre for the whole country. This is part of the strategy is formulated

by Arazi in its document, “Operational Strategy to Become a Modern Public Land Services Institution.” Part of the technical training could be done by the Survey Department of the Kabul Polytechnic University. An MOU should be signed between the university and Arazi for a continuing education program on all aspects of land surveying.

### **Upgrading and Formalization**

4. *What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements model developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad? Are there opportunities for replicating this model in other cities of Afghanistan?*

LARA’s formalization work in the Jalalabad pilot projects of Campoona and Araban made significant progress since the mid-term evaluation, when formalization was not yet initiated and the upgrading work was still in the planning stage. Most of the upgrading work involved street paving and drainage canal construction. LARA subcontracted GeoPlanning as the first private company in the country to do the social and physical surveys of both Jalalabad settlements. Arazi’s staff surveyors did not participate in the work.

The formalization work resulted in significant progress that was recognized by each community council. Twenty-five percent of parcels were registered and received deeds of title; an equal proportion was recognized as having a customary title. In all, 2,780 parcels were surveyed in the two pilot areas. Most importantly, property rights of the parcel holder were formally recognized in the form of a tax book (*tasfia*). The *tasfia* is recognition of the parcel holder’s right to the property in the community’s eyes as well as the first step to receiving formal ownership to the parcel. The result is that nearly every property holder is on a track leading to a formal deed of title.

All records in both settlements were recorded in the OpenTitle software system, which is held by the municipality. Although the Evaluation Team was not able to physically examine the database in the municipal offices, it found that the OpenTitle records were not available for use by MUDA, IDLG, AGCHO, the Supreme Court in Jalalabad, nor Arazi itself. In each instance, the software and passwords for OpenTitle were unavailable. OpenTitle data is not currently capable of being integrated into Arazi’s yet unutilized ALRMIS software. The Supreme Court uses another software, the Deeds Registry Archive Conversion System (DRACS), which is also not integrated into ALRMIS. Ultimately, the creation of a viable cadastre will require that all OpenTitle and DRACS data be migrated into a working ALRMIS system.

The Evaluation Team traveled to Jalalabad to meet with government stakeholders and the councils and residents of the Araban and Campoona informal settlements. The Campoona council was particularly unhappy with LARA’s upgrading work. Members complained that the full plan was not completed, that substandard reinforcement metal bars (rebars) were used, and that inadequate amounts of cement were used in the concrete mix. LARA appears to have hired a contractor but did not closely supervise or inspected its completed work. The

result was the council complained that LARA did little or nothing to upgrade its settlement, when in fact the Evaluation Team stood on a lengthy expanse of street paved by LARA. The community's expectations were raised, but left unfulfilled.

During the tour of the settlement, the Evaluation Team found itself witnessing a near fistfight between one of the community leaders (*wakil-i gozar*) and a property holder who accused him of pocketing funds that were dedicated to paving the street. The property holder had torn down his wall facing the street so that the road could be widened; owing to poor coordination and project management, the street was not extended, and he had to reconstruct his wall at his own expense. The probable cause of the dispute and the claims of unfinished or poorly executed work were LARA's failure to clearly communicate and document what work would actually be done, as opposed to what was discussed.

Upgrading work requires long and diligent planning and consensus building within the whole community, careful documentation, and extensive follow-up. LARA appears to have been rushed for time and failed to make the necessary effort to inspect the results with the community council. The Evaluation Team was also accosted by a young leader who told us of the health hazards of youth playing in the numerous piles of raw garbage that were supposed to be disposed of in LARA-funded trash containers.

At the midterm of the project, the Evaluation Team met with and witnessed the participation of the women's council in both settlements. For the final evaluation, however, women surprisingly denied they had ever been consulted or that they had any voice in the determination of LARA upgrading work. Whatever the case, they said their advice was ignored.

In spite of blips in implementation, the LARA model for formalization is readily adaptable in the majority of the informal settlements that exist in every large city of Afghanistan. The whole city of Jalalabad is already mapped. Kabul is an obvious starting point, where there are already efforts at formalization (e.g. the Kabul Urban Reconstruction, or KURP, project). The project in Jalalabad was done on flat lands. These properties can easily be incorporated in the city framework in terms of the provision of services, like water, electricity, and road maintenance. This model cannot easily be duplicated in informal settlements built on steep terrain or on mountainsides, as is the case of Kabul. A new approach will have to be determined for those settlements. A feasibility study should be carried out in order to resolve the issue.

A comprehensive cadastral project for the all of Afghanistan can be implemented at no cost to the government and can be auto-financed by revenues generated from the registration of title deeds and cadastral plans. Similar projects were realized in the civil codes of other countries and provinces, such as Quebec in Canada.

## Capacity Building

### 5. *How are the trainees using the skills they gained from the LARA-sponsored training?*

LARA reported extensive training, both internally and with partner ministries, but the sustainable impact of much of this training is questionable. The project conducted early trainings for MUDA and IDLG staff members on procurement and management. LARA reported that 70 percent later said they utilized the skills learned in this training in their daily work. The leadership of both ministries, however, complained that the training utilized World Bank materials viewed online in English, and failed to include handouts for participants. The Deputy Directors of both ministries said in our interviews that the training was marginally useful.

In most instances, LARA failed to conduct training needs assessments (IDLG and MUDA complained specifically about this). Most seriously, the project failed to provide concrete training materials that taught specific skills and that could be used by participants for subsequent or independent study. Evaluations were perfunctory, if conducted at all.

When the Evaluation Team requested agendas, lists of participants, and copies of training materials and evaluations, it was told that they were unavailable because they are in the process of being shipped to the contractor's home office. This meant that the Evaluation Team needed to shift to a strategy of obtaining the required materials through the training participants. This effort, however, produced little useful results. In meeting with each organization, we sought to interview or conduct a focus group with LARA trainees. In most cases, they were scattered or unavailable. The training was usually undocumented, or poorly documented, using equipment manuals or simple overviews. The bottom line is that much of LARA's training was inadequate, likely to be unsustainable, and not possible to replicate.

This is a critical problem in view of the significant continuing need for training within Arazi and with other stakeholders. At the mid-term evaluation, a "best practices" training approach was thoroughly discussed with LARA; it did subsequently implement the plan. Using LARA's quarterly reports, the Evaluation Team tracked all trainings to reconstruct the results. Our analysis did not match the totals reported. We do not suspect falsification, merely poor management of an inadequate training process. Unfortunately, this legacy of training has been passed on to Arazi, which has and will have substantial training responsibilities internally and with its constituents.

The Project Implementation Letter (PIL) signed on October 31, 2011 with MUDA, IDLG, and AGCHO specified USAID's contribution to provide "long and short-term technical assistance, hardware and software, and training in different subjects." The PIL provided for technical assistance and on-the-job training to staff of relevant MUDA departments and the Jalalabad municipalities, including "support for the set-up of required IT systems and the invitation of key staff to attend training on land related issues." Furthermore, the PIL stated that LARA, through its implementing partner Tetra Tech ARD, should carry out the

following tasks in collaboration with AGCHO: “provide technical support and capacity building in technical services and equipment that contribute to the improvement of current geodesy, cadastral surveying and GIS practices – which includes support for the establishment of required IT systems for cadastral data management in the Kabul and Jalalabad offices of AGCHO.”

The Presidential Decree that announced Arazi will be Afghanistan’s Independent Land Authority, and the transfer of the Cadastral Department from AGCHO to Arazi, brought some confusion as to the roles and responsibilities of the land authorities in Afghanistan. It became obvious that AGCHO lost some of its status and responsibilities concerning land to the new organization Arazi. The capacity building and training that was supposed to take place did not materialize in a substantial way, mainly due to the new institutional reform in land that was happening in Afghanistan.

One of LARA’s most significant achievements is the publication of numerous handbooks and guides documenting the project’s work. These materials can be used in Arazi’s future work, and can also be useful as training materials. The most significant are:

- Community-Based Dispute Resolution (CBDR) Guidelines;
- Evaluation of Legislation Affecting Women;
- Land Legislative Booklet;
- Institutional assessments of MAIL/Arazi, AGCHO, MUDA, IDLG/GDMA, and the Supreme Court regarding how their respective activities affect land administration;
- Desk Review of Women’s Land Rights in Afghanistan;
- Informal Settlement Upgrading Handbook;
- Update of the BizCLIR report on doing business in Afghanistan;
- Urban Development Guidelines;
- Land Rights and Upgrading Formalization Manual; and,
- Land Valuation Manual and supplement.

A minority of the project’s publications are poorly conceived and, therefore, of little use for the future. LARA’s Land Valuation Manual and two reports about real estate appraisal, for example, are virtually useless as a guide to current appraisal work in Afghanistan and exhibit a superficial understanding of what appraisal in the country requires. The workshop materials provide an inadequate guide to mass appraisal, which in itself falls short of the country’s current needs. It certainly cannot be used as a training manual to address the new profession’s needs.

## **Sector Impact & Way Forward**

### *6. How did LARA affect the land market framework that encourages economic growth?*

The ultimate goals of the pilot projects in Jalalabad were to give informal settlers security of tenure, and produce ownership titles for the settlements' property. The road to economic recovery goes through the establishment of reliable cadastral system coupled with a secure land registry. The mechanism has been put in place by LARA to achieve this goal. It needs to be implemented now in other municipalities in Afghanistan.

A major step forward was achieved when GIRA recognized Arazi as an Independent Land Authority with the mandate to become a modern public land services institution. This helped clear some of the confusion between the different agencies that deal with lands in Afghanistan. There is still room for open discussion and for roles to be further defined for those different agencies. This institutional revamping will go a long way toward the establishment of a solid land market framework in Afghanistan.

LARA's legislative and formalization work significantly contributes to the development of the real property market, which underlays economic growth and social stabilization. LARA and Arazi's legal team worked with MUDA and IDLG to revise the drafts of the Land Management Law and Land Acquisition Law that are currently before the Parliament for adoption. Although the deputy director of MUDA complained about LARA's contributions to the draft laws, the Evaluation Team's legal specialists judged the draft amendments to be well-conceived and likely to be adopted when Parliament passes the laws. The fate of the Anti-Land Grabbing Law, however, remains to be determined; it has been passed by the lower chamber of parliament, but remains in the upper chamber.

## **Gender and Outreach**

### *7. How has awareness of women's land rights and inheritance changed as a result of LARA's public information campaigns?*

LARA's public information campaign was centered on billboards posted in Kabul and related media events. The project also published and distributed illustrated booklets on women's inheritance rights. These booklets have illustrated explanations, but remain unintelligible to illiterate people. The independent study of the impact of LARA's media campaign, conducted by Eureka Research, documented awareness and public criticism, it was unable to document widespread impact or a resultant change in behavior.

### *8. What were the results of LARA-sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?*

Despite the above findings, LARA was able to document 72 instances of Afghan women inquiring about or seeking their land rights in response to the awareness campaign. It also

generated several success stories and positive coverage in a Washington D.C.-based web newspaper. In the end, however, the impact on the contractor and donor was probably more substantial than on the Afghan public. This is not an argument for dropping the public awareness effort; instead, it should be recast to be more direct in its message, more appealing to an Afghan audience, and given much wider dissemination, especially in rural areas and villages.

The awareness campaign needed better design, more in-depth penetration of its target audience, and intensive follow-up. The design of the billboards seems to have elicited more comment on the woman featured than on the message of inheritance rights. It was difficult to get any female, never mind an older Afghan woman, to appear on the billboard design. This should have been a cultural warning sign for LARA. The Afghan-American leader of the Afghan Women's Network suggested the billboard feature an older woman or a family that suffered from errant practices. She said the message should have been explicit, not implied.

LARA conducted two 'gender in the workplace' assessments for MAIL/Arazi and MUDA, resulting in recommendations to management to enable them to enforce gender equality. In partnership with MoWA, the project also hosted the first National Conference on Women's Inheritance and Land Rights to highlight women's rights, as guaranteed under the Afghan Constitution and civil codes.

A subcomponent of LARA's capacity development work was advancing women's rights to land ownership through registration and inheritance. LARA also conducted a study of discriminatory practices. The major problem appears to be traditional practices in villages, rather than *sharia* law. In light of LARA's campaign for women's land and inheritance rights, it is ironic that women on Arazi's staff complained they had received little training and participated little in Arazi's programming.

#### **IV. CONCLUSIONS**

Arazi has the staff, leadership, and reorganized role to function as Afghanistan's lead land agency. It is located in a secure, functional complex of offices that are well-constructed and laid -out to do its work. The agency will soon be backed by the reformed Land Management Law. Nonetheless, Arazi faces significant challenges.

##### *Development of the Cadastre*

In the near future, Arazi needs institutional reform to augment its capacity to perform as the lead institution for land management and administration in all of Afghanistan. In the past, this role was never the mandate of a single organization. This adds pressure to Arazi to perform to the aspiration of many stakeholders.

Cadastre is a legal land system and a by-product of the civil code with its own intricacies, rules, and regulations. Common-law countries might refer from time-to-time to a cadastral

system, but the implication is not a legal one and generally refers to the registration of documents into GIS software.

There are programs that have been implemented at no cost to taxpayers in civil code countries and can be replicated in Afghanistan with help and expertise. The Province of Quebec in Canada has a digital cadastral system that includes over four million parcels in a digital land and title registry. Implemented at no cost to local taxpayers, this system is now generating profits from the continuing registration of cadastral plans and title deeds. Other possibly useful models are registration systems of Costa Rica, Turkey, and Kazakhstan.

Because the new cadastral law will permit private land surveying firms to carry out cadastral surveys, the Cadastral Department's scope of work will have to focus on the administration and management of the cadastral contracts given to the private sector. The Department will not have to do the field surveys itself, but supervise the field operations and remain abreast of the technics of modern surveying operation.

This new avenue of managing and administering the cadastre will need to be implemented throughout Arazi. Institutional reform needs to take place at Arazi through the help of donor agencies. The Surveying Department at Kabul Polytechnic University should give continuing education courses in surveying to Arazi personnel.

Cadastral reform programs have taken place in different civil code countries in order to make the necessary step from a paper-based cadastre to a digital one. Arazi should look at the results from different countries in that respect and gain from their experience.

Data from the Open Title system (used by the subcontractor and held by the municipality) needs to be migrated to a complete ALRMIS system controlled and operated by Arazi. A systemic effort also needs to be put in place to complete the formalization work already done by advancing the non-titled parcels to full deeds of title. This significant task is lying at Arazi's doorstep. If it is not completed, then much of the formalization achievement in Jalalabad will be eroded, and the model will be discredited as another failed donor program.

### *Challenge of Scale in Formalization and Registration*

Arazi has the example of two successful pilot projects in formalization. This effort must be scaled up. There are opportunities to do so in every Afghan city. This will require, however, a detailed expansion of Arazi's strategic plan. The scale of this effort is such that Arazi will be challenged to forge new relationships with MUDA, IDLG, the subject municipalities, Kabul Polytechnic University, and the private sector, especially the incipient real estate professions of surveyors, appraisers, and brokers.

Formalization work will have to be extended to the rural sector. This may well require Arazi to establish a new working relationship with AGCHO. Arazi could contract AGCHO to produce a rural survey and formalize properties under its direction and supervision, with Arazi's entry of the data into the ALRMIS database.



Registration and formalization are Arazi's key challenges. How well it addresses these challenges will determine Arazi's, and perhaps the government's and Afghanistan's, future.

### *Training Challenge*

Training remains a significant problem area. In the final project report, LARA describes its staff as having received tens of weeks of hands-on training (strangely reported as thousands of man hours), specifically on the use of standard survey equipment. The Evaluation Team believes most of this instruction came in the form of unstructured descriptions of how to use survey equipment based on user manuals. This is neither effective, nor replicable and sustainable training. Arazi's Kabul staff has high morale, but its performance is yet untested.

Arazi needs to augment its training capacity to include effective workshops in community-based dispute resolution, gender guidelines in inheritance and land ownership, and use of the revised ALRMIS software system. All of this must include advanced training for trainers, development of training materials that can be used both during workshops and in participants' daily work, and critical evaluation of results, both immediately after the training and in the longer term in the workplace. The Evaluation Team doubts that the robust training program needed can be implemented by Arazi without substantive help from expatriate consultants. Arazi's existing training team is not up to the task.

Arazi needs to build the capacity of its staff in Kabul and in its regional offices, where the training has hardly begun. To date, only a single staff member from the regional offices has been trained. Arazi's own survey staff was not involved in the Jalalabad pilot projects; it is telling that GeoPlanning expressed doubts about Arazi's capabilities. Knowing how to use survey equipment is not enough; Arazi needs to train its Kabul and regional staff to not only conduct land surveys throughout the cities of the country, but also to supervise, contract, and evaluate the work of the numerous private-sector surveyors that will be required. Arazi's task at hand is so large that it should consider developing the capacity of the residual organization AGCHO, as Arazi-trained and supervised surveyors to conduct rural surveys in areas designated according to a strategic work plan.

Beyond its work in developing public sector land administration, Arazi can play a significant role in private sector development by managing the development of private sector surveyors and contracting them to conduct surveys in support of land titling and development throughout the country.

### *The Challenge of Women's Rights*

LARA's public information campaign on women's land rights was centered on billboards posted in Kabul and related media events. It also published and distributed illustrated booklets on women's inheritance and land rights. An independent study of the media

campaign documented awareness and public criticism, but was unable to document widespread impact or a resultant change in behavior.

LARA was able to document 72 instances of Afghan women inquiring about or seeking their land rights in response to the awareness campaign. The campaign also generated several success stories and positive coverage in a Washington D.C.-based web newspaper. In the end, however, the impact on the contractor and donor was probably more substantial than on the Afghan public. This is not an argument for dropping the public awareness effort; instead, it should be recast to be more direct in its message, more appealing to an Afghan audience, and given much wider dissemination, especially in rural areas and villages. The campaign needs better design, more in-depth penetration of its target audience, and intensive follow-up.

LARA also integrated a gender advancement strategy into its strategic plan. It is a positive example of what is possible in other GIRoA entities.

### *Financial Challenge*

Arazi should be sustained by continued financial support until it can become self-financing.<sup>1</sup> Its strategic plan should be enhanced and redirected from focusing on its own organization to a broadening and deepening program of national property titling, fighting corruption in the property market, and promoting equity in women's rights in land ownership. Arazi's remit should not be broadened, but intensified to embrace a national scale program of registration to be realized within three to five years. This will require greater production from Arazi itself, but also mobilization of the private sector, AGCHO, and Kabul Polytechnic University as allied forces in the effort. Public awareness of reforms in the property sector and their importance to economic development should be addressed, as well as the development of private-sector real estate professions and associations. The donor community should ensure that the program's gains to date are not lost and help consolidate Arazi's strategic plan into a national program.

### *Summary*

In its closeout report, LARA stated that Arazi continues to be a heavily centralized institution that is often paralyzed by bureaucracy, and still has a limited institutional capacity to assume responsibility for active day-to-day management of staff and processes. Furthermore, the agency has a lack of skilled staff and effective management. The Evaluation Team believes this is a candid assessment of Arazi's current state. The internal management challenges, along with the necessity of making the ALRMIS software system fully functional, are Arazi's main tasks at hand.

---

<sup>1</sup> The cadastral system of Quebec is a particularly interesting model in that it is self-financing, being paid for by the fees from its use. See <http://www.mern.gouv.qc.ca/english/land/cadastre/cadastre-reform-new-field.jsp>

By creating a pathway to real property ownership, LARA's potential for promoting both domestic and international direct investment and enhancing general economic productivity is immense. Secure tenure allows the property market to take off. It can also significantly mitigate conflict over land ownership (the most contentious area of Afghan society), as well as help legitimate the government. In its pilot communities, LARA demonstrated in an initial, modest way to formalize and register stable property ownership. Most important, by mentoring and assisting Arazi's emergence, LARA has created an agent to continue the reform of the real property market in Afghanistan. Arazi should provide leadership and a working example of a progressive, effective, and non-corrupt administration.

## **V. RECOMMENDATIONS**

Based on the preceding findings and conclusions, the Evaluation Team has seven recommendations:

### **RECOMMENDATION 1: MAKE ALRMIS A FULLY FUNCTIONAL NATIONAL CADASTRAL PROGRAM**

The most critical and immediate task at hand is to correct the ALRMIS fields and processes to move forward with the system's implementation. The fundamental issue to be resolved is to make the system functional and acceptable in Arazi's eyes. This also means that data from the Open Title system gathered in Jalalabad (and anywhere else in the future) must be fully migrated and integrated into ALRMIS. The cadastral system should be simplified by using only a geo-referenced centroid for each property, with a unique identification lot number. This would not require immediate delineation of each property's boundaries.

Separate from the technical aspects of ALRMIS, the software system itself and Arazi's functioning need to be established as a self-financing system. Although this may require short-term financing from the central budget or from donor support, Arazi should move to being financed by fees for its registration services. Fees should be substantive, but nominal enough not to inhibit the development of real property markets. A standard, transparent schedule of fees should be implemented to shield users from a rent-seeking bureaucracy.

A related task is to enhance Arazi's Cadastral Department by making it fully digital. This effort should embrace the AGCHO's cadastral work as well.

### **RECOMMENDATION 2: RECAST THE ARAZI TRAINING CENTER**

The existing training group in Arazi is seriously deficient and cannot develop and field sustainable training and capacity development. It should be reconstructed and rededicated as a Cadastral Training Institute for Arazi and its provincial organs, as well as all other organizations involved in land development. This will require consultant assistance to establish a robust, skills-based training program (capable of needs assessment, materials

development, and impact evaluation), using international best practices. The new training institute should develop a plan for training of trainers, curriculum development, and fielding training to Arazi's provincial offices, its internal staff, and related governmental organs. Its remit should include expansion of community-based dispute resolution (CBDR) and women's land rights workshops so that they are conducted in all provinces. It is also advisable that the CBDR workshop materials go beyond booklets and be published as DVD instruction in both Dari and Pashto.

### RECOMMENDATION 3: ACCELERATE AND SIMPLIFY THE TITLING PROCESS

To meet the challenge of mass, nationwide registration, it is necessary to accelerate and simplify the titling process, as well as to focus resources and eliminate organizational redundancies. To attain this objective:

- Granting title should change from a judicial to an administrative process under the aegis of Arazi. Requiring all grants of title to go through the judicial process is too slow and simply unnecessary. The courts should concentrate on combatting fraud and resolving conflicting claims.
- There should be a one-time granting of title deeds to all parcel holders (urban and rural) who have no competing claimants to their property, are not involved in land grabbing, have paid their taxes, and have been registered in the ALRMIS database for five years. This might represent a shortening of the 38-year term of the existing adverse possession law for the sake of overcoming the disruption of 35 years of war. The popular impact would be immense: the President and his cabinet would be seen as the government that "gave me my land." Significant investment in the new privately-titled property would be sure to follow, along with substantial economic growth. If possible, GIRoA might even consider a three-year, rather than the suggested five-year term.

### RECOMMENDATION 4: DEVELOP PRIVATE SECTOR APPRAISERS, SURVEYORS, AND REAL PROPERTY BROKERAGE PROFESSIONS

Development of the real property market in Afghanistan will require clear advances in the development of real estate property professions: surveyors, appraisers, and brokers. Arazi does not have a staff of adequately trained surveyors to survey the informal and formal settlements of the nation. The Evaluation Team recommends that Arazi does not attempt all of the actual surveying, but that it supervises the process by certifying and contracting private sector surveyors (e.g. graduates of the surveying program at Kabul Polytechnic University). Arazi simply does not have the number of competent surveyors it needs to survey the mass of property in a timely fashion in the near future. The university exists as a resource to produce surveyors, which can be certified by Arazi and can get on with the enormous work that needs to be done. Arazi needs a concrete strategy to both provide and direct survey work in the country.

Development of an Afghan capacity for real estate appraisal was neglected from even the days of Land Titling and Economic Restructuring Activity (LTERA), LARA's predecessor. It is now a critical priority. LARA's very slim, inadequate work in introducing the idea of mass appraisal falls far short of the needs of the market. Afghanistan needs appraisers who can conduct a single-parcel appraisal, the most basic valuation. This would provide the database for mass appraisal, but more importantly would provide the skills needed for determining lease rates, property tax assessment, appeals, as well as future mortgage lending.

Real estate brokerage needs to progress beyond its very unprofessional current existence to become a competent, ethical, and legally-recognized profession. Along with appraisers, brokers are the catalysts to the development of the market and provision of real world data on value.

Arazi's strategic plan should embrace the development of this triad of private-sector real estate professions. This will allow it to meet its current mandate and ensure the long-term development of the property market. Each profession will require certification training, licensing, codes of ethics, and self-governing associations. Using consultancies and private sector associations in the United States and United Kingdom, USAID has utilized this development model throughout its work in Eastern Europe, the Middle East and North Africa, and the former Soviet Union. Arazi should manage the process, not direct it.

#### RECOMMENDATION 5: EXTEND ARAZI GENDER DEVELOPMENT AND ACTION PLANS

Arazi should implement its action plan and undertake gender development work in all of its district offices. It should publish the Arazi gender guidelines for use in titling procedures, CBDR workshops, and for broad public awareness. Finally, Arazi should encourage other GIRoA organs to follow its example. Opportunities to broaden the impact of Arazi gender programs through USAID's new Promote program should be actively sought and encouraged.

Public awareness campaigns should be redesigned in consultation with civil society organizations to render the messages more effective, have local appeal, and be given wider distribution, especially in villages and rural areas. Media utilized should include short televised theater and discussion groups, as well as village roundtables and DVD media that can be distributed to libraries and NGOs.

#### RECOMMENDATION 6: SEEK PRESIDENTIAL AND CABINET LEADERSHIP TO SECURE PASSAGE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF PROPOSED LAND LEGISLATION

The Land Management Law (LML) and Land Acquisition Law (LAL) are currently in Parliament. Their passage without damaging revisions will require strong executive leadership. Passage of a robust and effective Anti-Land Grabbing Law is necessary to ensure the credibility of the government's anti-corruption commitment and to spur economic

development. The risk in passing an ineffective law will deflate public expectations and will signal the triumph of business as usual, rather than reform in the land economy. Arazi should closely support the President's work in the wake of the London Conference and afterwards by seeking to identify and exclude rent-seeking, falsification, and fraud in its surveying, formalization, and other programs and by publishing standard fees and procedures, as well as citizens' rights as participants in Arazi's work.

The Cadastral Law is being modified by Presidential Decree to permit the use of the private sector in the survey of urban and rural lands. The private sector has always been in tune with new surveying technology and will be able to carry out the mandate under the supervision of the Cadastral Department at Arazi. This new procedure will go a long way in helping the Cadastral Department at Arazi to move in the new direction of managing and administering Afghanistan's properties.

The Cadastral Law is also being modified to include procedures and regulations on the survey of Afghanistan's lands. Survey regulations and procedures are always refined as technology advances; being part of a Law on Cadastre makes their modifications more complicated and unnecessary. Regulations and procedures on land surveys should be spelled out in a separate document. The final process of registering new title deeds of informal settlements should be carried out by Arazi and moved into the ALRMIS software. Full title deed ownership should be given after five years of undisputed occupation.

#### RECOMMENDATION 7: SEPARATE MANAGEMENT OF FORMALIZATION FROM UPGRADING

Arazi needs to emphasize and accelerate formalization. While necessary, upgrading should be managed as a separate effort, financed by formalization and taxation. It should not compete with formalization for scarce resources, nor confuse the focus on formalization. Arazi should emulate the UN Habitat style of upgrading, which emphasizes active community involvement in deciding the objectives and managing the upgrading process, as well as ensuring involvement of the women's councils.

## ANNEX I: SCOPE OF WORK

**Office of Economic Growth and Infrastructure (OEGI)  
&  
OFFICE OF PROGRAM AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT (OPPD)**

### STATEMENT OF WORK

**Final Performance Evaluation  
OF  
Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Project**

#### I. PROGRAM INFORMATION

<b>Project Name:</b>	Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA)
<b>Contractor:</b>	Tetra Tech/ ARD
<b>Contract #:</b>	306 C-00-11-00514-00
<b>Total Estimated Cost:</b>	US \$41,800,000
<b>Life of Project:</b>	January 2011- November 2014
<b>Active Provinces:</b>	Kabul and Nangarhar
<b>Mission Development Objective (DO):</b>	DO 1: Foundation Created for Sustainable, Agricultural-led Economic Growth
<b>Linkage to Standard Program Structure (SPS):</b>	N/A
<b>Required?</b>	Required - pilot
<b>Public or Internal:</b>	Public

#### II. INTRODUCTION

USAID/Afghanistan seeks to carry out a Final Performance Evaluation of the implementation of the Land Reform in Afghanistan Project (LARA) – Contract Number: 306C-00-11-00514-00. The LARA contract was signed with Tetra Tech ARD on January 30, 2011 and was scheduled to take place in two phases, each approximately 18 months in duration – the Base Period: January 30, 2011 until July 31, 2012; the Option Period: August 1, 2012 until February 1, 2014; and the No Cost Extension Period: February 2, 2014 until November 2, 2014. This final performance evaluation will cover the entire timeframe of the project, January 2011 until November 2014.

LARA is intended to support GIRoA in the implementation of the National Land Policy by developing a robust, enduring, Afghan-owned and managed land market framework that encourages investment and productivity growth, mitigates land-based conflict, and builds confidence in the government’s legitimacy, thereby enhancing stability in Afghan society.

The findings from the final performance evaluation will help to determine the sustainability of USAID's efforts - e.g., whether beneficiaries continue to experience the positive effects engendered by LARA project, or whether other land reform institutions will continue to offer services similar to those being provided by USAID.

### **III. BACKGROUND**

LARA intends to support the Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan (GIROA) in the implementation of the National Land Policy by developing a robust, enduring, Afghan owned and managed land market framework that encourages investment, fosters productivity growth, mitigates land-based conflict, and builds confidence in the government's legitimacy, thereby enhancing stability in Afghan society.

LARA includes three project components:

- **Component 1:** Strengthen land tenure security through formalization and upgrading informal settlements.
- **Component 2:** Identify legal amendments related to land reform, and provide legal support to Afghan Land Authority (MAIL/Arazi), Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA), and Afghan Geodesy and Cartographic Head Office (AGCHO).
- **Component 3:** Build the capacity of public and private sectors to provide efficient land-related services and urban planning & management skills.

### **IV. PROGRAM GOALS AND OBJECTIVES**

LARA is designed to contribute to USAID's Assistance Objective (AO) 4 and the Afghanistan National Development Strategy, specifically two National Priority Programs, Agriculture and Rural Development, and Urban Management Support Program. LARA has the following objectives:

- Improve property rights delivery (land administration and formalization).
- Enable all citizens (women, minorities, and vulnerable populations) to exercise their rights through public information awareness.
- Strengthen land dispute resolution processes to reduce conflict and promote peace and stability.
- Strengthen institutional, policy, and legal reform to secure property rights for Afghan citizens.
- Provide assistance in the cross-cutting areas of gender, training, public information awareness, and private sector development.

### **V. PURPOSE OF THIS EVALUATION**

The purpose of this evaluation is to learn to what extent LARA project objectives and goals have been achieved, document the successes and weaknesses of the project, and develop recommendations to inform the Mission management on the feasibility of supporting land reform initiatives across USAID's Afghanistan programs.

USAID/Afghanistan will use the evaluation's conclusions and recommendations to inform the Afghan Land Authority (Arazi), the World Bank and other donors, and other GIROA



stakeholders of the nature and scope of possible future interventions in the land reform sector, based on lessons learned from LARA.

The evaluation's recommendations should:

- \* inform the World Bank and others on the outstanding institutional capacity building needs within the Afghan Land Authority (Arazi);
- \* inform GIROA stakeholders<sup>2</sup> on the possibilities for replicating the model of upgrading and formalization of informal settlement developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad; and
- \* Inform USAID Afghanistan on recommendations for future assistance in the Afghan land reform process.

## VI. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The questions to answer, in order of priority, are as follows:

### **Systems & Sustainability:**

1. Have the land management/administrative system upgrades improved functionality for Arazi? If so, how? If not, what were the obstacles?
2. What are the perceptions of the officials and staff of the advantages/disadvantages of the new systems?
3. How will Arazi maintain the systems and sustain operational efficiency and scaling once LARA assistance is completed?

### **Upgrading and Formalization:**

4. What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements model developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad? Are there opportunities for replicating this model in other cities of Afghanistan?

### **Capacity Building:**

5. How are the trainees using the skills they gained from the LARA-sponsored training?

### **Sector Impact & Way Forward:**

6. How did LARA affect the land market framework that encourages economic growth?

### **Gender and outreach:**

7. How has awareness of women's land rights and inheritance changed as a result of LARA's public information campaigns?
8. What were the results of LARA sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?

The recommendations section of the report will focus on action USAID and other donors, such as the World Bank, can take to further strengthen the land market framework and address the institutional capacity needs of Arazi.

---

<sup>2</sup> The GIROA stakeholders include Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office (AGCHO), Afghan Land Authority (Arazi); Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG), Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA), and Jalalabad Municipality.

## **VII. METHODOLOGY**

The Evaluation Team will be responsible for developing an evaluation strategy and methodology that include a mix of qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis approaches. The methodology will be presented as part of the draft work plan as outlined in the deliverables below and included in the final report. The Evaluation Team will have access to a variety of program implementation documents and reports. Methodology strengths and weaknesses should be identified as well as measures taken to mitigate those weaknesses. All data collected and presented in the evaluation report must be disaggregated by gender and geography.

The suggested methodology should include, but is not limited to:

### **Interviews**

- m) Key interviews with USAID/Afghanistan's OEGI Staff;
- n) Interviews with Mayor and Municipal Officials in Jalalabad;
- o) Interviews with key staff in Arazi, AGCHO, IDLG/GDMA, MUDA, and Supreme Court;
- p) Interviews with implementing partner staff in Kabul;
- q) Interviews and focus groups with selected individuals;
- r) Interviews with residents of Araban and Campoona settlements in Jalalabad.

### **Consultations**

- a) World Bank and other donors (UNAMA, UNHABITAT);
- b) Members of the women task force working with Arazi; and

### **Data Analysis**

- a) Project performance data (from whom? USAID? IP?)
- b) Project-generated assessments

### **Document Review \***

- j) LARA Scope Of Work
- k) LARA Work Plans
- l) Quarterly Reports
- m) Annual Reports
- n) Current PMP and other M&E documents,
- o) Midterm Evaluation Report

\* USAID will make existing performance information sources available for review.

## **VIII. EVALUATION TEAM COMPOSITION**

The Evaluation Team shall include evaluation and technical specialists with relevant experience particularly in land reform management or urban development in a conflict/post-conflict country. The team shall include at least two objective, independent international experts and two high level Afghan experts with strong interpersonal and writing skills, and cultural awareness. Final selection of the members of the Evaluation Team is subject to agreement by the SUPPORT II Contracting Officer's Representative (COR), the USAID Contracts Officer (CO), and Checchi's SUPPORT II management team.

***Evaluation Team Leader (Expat):*** The Team Leader (TL) shall possess strong leadership, and report writing skills and be an evaluation expert with seven years of program evaluation experience. The TL will have experience with USAID funded economic growth programs. The TL shall possess at least a Master’s degree, in public administration reform, international development, or a related discipline. The TL should be able to write a high quality, standard, accurate, and concise report in English. Afghanistan or regional country experience is preferred.

***Technical Consultant (Expat):*** The Technical Consultant shall be a mid-to-senior level land administration or legal expert with at least 5-7 years of relevant experience in assessing and designing land programs, with experience in assessing, designing, and/or implementing land reform programs. The Technical Consultant should have extensive experience in conducting public sector quantitative and qualitative evaluations/assessments, and have demonstrated knowledge of capacity development programming. An advanced degree in conflict management, law, public administration, sociology or similar degree is required. Excellent oral and written communication skills in English are required. Afghanistan or regional country experience is preferred.

***Technical Consultant (Afghan):*** The Technical Consultant shall be mid-to-senior level land administration or legal expert with at least 5-7 years of relevant experience in assessing and designing land programs, with some experience and expertise in assessing, designing, and/or implementing land reform programs. The Technical Consultant should have extensive experience in conducting public sector quantitative and qualitative evaluations/assessments, and have demonstrated knowledge of capacity development programming. An advanced degree in conflict management, law, public administration, sociology or similar degree is required. Afghanistan or regional country experience and proficiency in English and Dari/Pashto is required.

***Evaluation Specialist (Afghan):*** The Evaluation Specialist shall possess at least a Bachelor’s degree, and have applied evaluation experience including data collection and analysis. Experience working with government officials, assessing government data, and knowledge of participatory appraisal methodologies (sampling and survey methods – e.g. interpersonal interviews and focus group discussions) is required. Afghanistan or regional country experience and proficiency in English and Dari/Pashto is required.

A statement of potential bias or conflict of interest (or lack thereof) is required of each team member.

## **IX. EVALUATION SCHEDULE**

The estimated time period for this Evaluation is 36 days level of effort (LOE), of which at least 20 days should be spent in Afghanistan. The expat team members should be in Kabul no later than September, 2014.

The evaluation team is authorized to work six days a week. The team is required to travel to Jalalabad where project activities have been implemented. At least 30% of the consultants’ time will be spent outside Kabul to conduct interviews with Jalalabad municipality officials, and residents of Araban and Campoona settlements.

**Illustrative LOE in days by activity:**

Activity	LOE for Expat Team Lead	LOE for Expat TC	LOE for Afghan TC	LOE for Afghan Evaluation Specialist	Total LOE in Days
Document review, work plan, draft questions, data analysis plan, suggested list of interviewees, finalized questions for the survey	4	4	4	4	16
Travel to and from Afghanistan	4	4			8
Meetings with USAID and Kabul based interviews	8	8	9	9	34
Interviews in provinces	7	7	7	7	28
Data analysis	3	3	3	3	12
Preliminary report	3	3	3	3	12
Presentation to USAID and Arazi	1	1	1	1	4
Draft final report and debrief to USAID	10	6	8	3	27
Final report	3	3			6
<b>Totals</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>147</b>

**Illustrative LOE in days by position:**

Position	Remote prep	Travel to/from Kabul	In-Country	Finalization of Report	Total
Expat Team Leader	4	4	33	2	43
Expat Consultant	4	4	29	2	39
Afghan Consultant			35		35
Afghan Specialist			30		30
<b>Totals</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>131</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>147</b>

**X. MANAGEMENT**

Checchi/SUPPORT-II will identify and hire the evaluation team, pending the COR's concurrence and CO approval, assist in developing the work plan, and arrange meetings with key stakeholders identified prior to the initiation of the fieldwork. The evaluation team may organize other meetings as identified during the course of the evaluation, in consultation with Checchi/SUPPORT-II and USAID/Afghanistan. Checchi/SUPPORT-II is responsible for all logistical support required for the evaluation team, including arranging accommodation, security, office space, computers, internet access, printing, communication, and transportation.

The evaluation team will officially report to Checchi/SUPPORT-II management. Checchi/SUPPORT-II is responsible for all direct coordination with USAID/Afghanistan/OPPD, through the SUPPORT II COR, Daryl Martyris ([dmartyris@state.gov](mailto:dmartyris@state.gov)). From a technical management perspective, the evaluation team will work closely with Gilbert Mwenedata ([GMwenedata@state.gov](mailto:GMwenedata@state.gov) : mobile # 0702626201). In order to maintain

objectivity, OPPD's monitoring and Evaluation Unit will make all final decisions about the evaluation.

## **XI. DELIVERABLES AND REPORTING REQUIREMENTS**

- 1. In-briefing:** Within 24 hours of arrival in Kabul, the Evaluation Team will have an in-brief meeting with the OPPD M&E unit and the OEGI Team for introductions and discussion of the team's understanding of the assignment, initial assumptions, evaluation questions, methodology, and initial work plan; and/or to adjust the SOW, if necessary.
- 2. Evaluation Work Plan:** Within three calendar days following the in-brief, the Evaluation Team Leader shall provide a detailed draft work plan to OPPD's M&E unit and OEGI, and a revised work plan two days after receiving consolidated comments from the SUPPORT II COR. USAID will share the initial work plan with Tetra Tech, allowing two full business days for comment, and revise accordingly. The initial work plan will include: (a) the overall evaluation design, including the proposed methodology, data collection and analysis plan, and data collection instruments; (b) a list of the team members indicating their primary contact details while in-country, including the e-mail address and mobile phone number for the team leader; and (c) the team's proposed schedule for the evaluation. The revised work plan shall include the list of interviewees and sites to visit.
- 3. Mid-term Briefing and Interim Meetings: Evaluation team will** hold a mid-term briefing with USAID on the status of the assessment including potential challenges and emerging opportunities. The team will also provide Arazi with periodic briefings and feedback on the team's findings. Additionally, a weekly 30-minute phone call with OPPD's M&E unit and OEGI will provide updates on field progress and any problems encountered.
- 4. PowerPoint and Final Presentation:** Hold an exit presentation to discuss summary of findings and recommendations to USAID. This presentation will be scheduled as agreed upon during the in-briefing, and five days prior to the evaluation team's departure from Kabul.
- 5. Draft Evaluation Report:** Shall be consistent with the guidance provided in Section XIII below. Length of the report: not to exceed 25 pages, exclusive of Annexes in English, using Times New Roman 12 point font, 1.15 line spacing, consistent with USAID branding policy. The report will address each of the issues and questions identified in the SOW and any other factors the team considers to have a bearing on the objectives of the evaluation. Any such factors can be included in the report only after consultation with USAID. **The draft evaluation report, per the format below, will be submitted by SUPPORT II within one week of the exit presentation for review and comments by USAID. USAID's M&E unit and OEGI office will have ten calendar days in which to review and comment and OPPD's M&E unit shall submit consolidated comments to SUPPORT II.**
- 6. Final Evaluation Report:** The final report will incorporate final comments provided by OPPD and OEGI. USAID comments are due within ten days after the receipt of the initial final draft. The final report should be submitted to OPPD within three days of receipt of comments by the Team Leader. All project data and records will be submitted in full and shall be in electronic form in easily readable format; organized and

documented for use by those not fully familiar with the project or evaluation; and owned by USAID.

7. **One-page briefer:** Following approval of the final report, a one page-briefer on key qualitative and quantitative findings must be included in the evaluation's scope—to be given to GIRoA Counterparts, so that they have the opportunity to review evaluation findings and share them as needed. Each briefer will be reviewed by OPPD and OEGI prior to distribution. If OEGI or OPPD disagrees with the briefers, they will provide comments to the evaluation team and clarify changes that need to be made. The final version of the briefer shall be translated in Dari and/or Pashto.

## **XII. FINAL REPORT FORMAT**

The evaluation report will be structured as follows:

1. Title Page
2. Table of Contents
3. List of any acronyms, tables, or charts (if needed)
4. Acknowledgements or Preface (optional)
5. Executive Summary (3-5 pages)
6. Introduction
  - a. A description of the project evaluated, including goal and expected results.
  - b. Brief statement on the purpose of the evaluation, including a list of the main evaluation questions.
  - c. Brief statement on the methods used in the evaluation such as desk/document review, interviews, site visits, surveys, etc.
7. Findings: This section should describe findings, focusing on each of the evaluation questions.
8. Conclusions: This section should include value statements supported by the data gathered during the evaluation process.
9. Recommendations: This section should include actionable statements for existing programming and recommendations for the design and performance of future programming. It should also include recommended future objectives and types of activities based on lessons learned.
10. Annexes
  - a. Scope of Work
  - b. Places Sites visited (list of entities and people interviewed)
  - c. Methodology description
  - d. Copies of all survey instruments and questionnaires
  - e. List of critical and key documents reviewed
  - f. Meeting notes of all key interviews
  - g. Statement of differences

### **XIII. REPORTING GUIDELINES**

- The evaluation report should represent a thoughtful, well-researched and well-organized effort to objectively evaluate the validity of the project's hypothesis and the effectiveness of the project.
- Evaluation reports shall address all evaluation questions included in the statement of work.
- The evaluation report will be written in highly professional English, free of colloquial language, grammatical and typographical error, and with professional formatting.
- The evaluation report should include the statement of work as an annex. Any modifications to the statement of work, whether in technical requirements, evaluation questions, evaluation team composition, methodology, or timeline need to be agreed upon in writing by the SUPPORT II COR.
- Evaluation methodology shall be explained in detail and all tools used in conducting the evaluation such as questionnaires, checklists and discussion guides will be included in an Annex in the final report.
- Evaluation findings will assess how results affected men and women.
- Limitations to the evaluation shall be disclosed in the report, with particular attention to the limitations associated with the evaluation methodology (selection bias, recall bias, unobservable differences between comparator groups, etc.).
- Evaluation findings should be presented as analyzed facts, evidence, and data and not based on anecdotes, hearsay, or the compilation of people's opinions. Findings should be specific, concise and supported by strong quantitative or qualitative evidence.
- Sources of information need to be properly identified and listed in an annex.
- Recommendations need to be supported by a specific set of findings.
- Recommendations should be action-oriented, practical, and specific, with defined responsibility for the action.

## **LARA Project achievements:**

During the base & option periods – (January 30, 2011 – February 1, 2014), LARA made progress in all three components. More concretely, the project documented the following achievements:

### **Component 1- Strengthen Land Tenure Security through Formalization and Upgrading of Informal Settlements -**

- Developed a “Land Rights Formalization and Settlement Upgrading Model for implementation in Afghanistan” providing a detailed "How to" for the replication of land rights regularization and informal settlement upgrading processes across Afghanistan.
- Completed settlement upgrading in Araban and Campoona, and handed over a Pashto translation of the Maintenance Plan to the communities. Over 4,000 man days skill labor and over 9,000 man day un-skill labor jobs were created as a result of the upgrading.
- Cadastral survey of 2,780 households in both settlements using a local surveying company; engaged AGCHO in the oversight of cadastral survey activities under the land inventory pilot activities in Jalalabad.
- Supported the physical refurbishment of seven technical GoIRA offices.
- Completed an Informal Settlement Upgrading Handbook in order to facilitate future planning and design of informal settlements upgrading activities.
- Developed Urban Development Guidelines to assist municipalities and GIROA institutions to prioritize informal settlements for development and land rights regularization.
- Completed a final draft of the National Policy for the Upgrading of Informal Settlements during the Technical Working Group at MUDA. The document is currently under review by the Cabinet of Ministers.
- Produced a Land Valuation Manual for Arazi.
- Provided IT systems to Arazi, AGCHO, Supreme Court and Jalalabad Municipality.
- Conducted a Feasibility Study for the development of an Industrial Park in Jalalabad.
- Conducted an analysis of the Tasfia (land rights identification and settlement of rights) and dispute resolution mechanisms within Arazi, which was followed up with in-house training for 160 Arazi staff.
- Conducted the “on call land dispute resolution trainings” for 150 tribal elders in Jalalabad.
- Produced “gender sensitized” documents (Land Management Law, gender integration in the mapping process, involving women in community-based dispute resolution related to the mapping/upgrading process).
- The LARA project in partnership with the Ministry of Women’s Affairs hosted the first “National Conference on Women’s Inheritance and Land Rights” in Afghanistan. The event aimed to highlight Afghan women’s inheritance and land rights guaranteed under the Constitution of Afghanistan and the various civil codes that protect those rights.



- Launched a Public Information Awareness Campaign on women’s inheritance and property rights in Afghanistan and conducted an evaluation project to assess message impact and redesign the message for maximum effectiveness. As a result of the campaign, 55 cases related to women’s difficulties in receiving their land and inheritance rights were referred to MOWA and other Government institutions in Kabul and provinces.
- The project conducted two “gender in the work place” assessments for counterparts (such as MAIL/Arazi and MUDA). The findings provided specific recommendations to the management, which will enable them to enforce gender equality at these two institutions.

### **Component 2 - Legal Framework**

- Organized public consultation workshops (public participation in legislative development is unprecedented in Afghanistan) in 7 provinces to collect public input on the Land Management Law and its implementation procedures.
- Prepared comprehensive amendments to Land Management Law (highlighting community participation in land clearance process and decentralization of leasing of government land). Also, the draft law is now more gender-responsive and it includes strengthened penalty provisions, which represent important steps toward fighting corruption and “land grabbing.”
- Prepared a draft of a comprehensive Law on Cadastre for the Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office (AGCHO), focusing on modern fieldwork methodologies such as GIS and GPS).
- Completed a Business Climate Legal and Institutional Reform (BizCLIR) Assessment of Real Estate.
- Developed a Land Legislative Booklet that provides an overview of land-related legislation. This booklet will help to raise the awareness of Afghans about the key articles of the Land Management Law.

### **Component 3- Capacity Building**

- Trained 2,558 male & female participants from the private and public sectors (29 types of training and 65 training iterations conducted).
- Completed the institutional assessments of MAIL/Arazi and AGCHO, MUDA, IDLG/GDMA, and the Supreme Court insofar as how their respective activities touch land administration.
- Supported and contributed to MAIL/Arazi’s national training seminar on land leasing and other land policy-related issues. This training was attended by over 160 MAIL/staff from various provinces.

## ANNEX II: WORKPLAN

**Office of Economic Growth and Infrastructure (OEGI)  
&  
OFFICE OF PROGRAM AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT (OPPD)**

**DRAFT WORK PLAN  
27 OCTOBER 2014**

**Final Performance Evaluation  
OF  
Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Project**

### XIV. PURPOSE OF THIS EVALUATION

The purpose of this evaluation is to learn to what extent LARA project objectives and goals have been achieved, document the successes and weaknesses of the project, and develop recommendations to inform the Mission management on the feasibility of supporting land reform initiatives across USAID's Afghanistan programs.

USAID/Afghanistan will use the evaluation's conclusions and recommendations to inform the Afghan Land Authority (Arazi), the World Bank and other donors, , and other GIROA stakeholders of the nature and scope of possible future interventions in the land reform sector, based on lessons learned from LARA.

The evaluation's recommendations should:

- \* inform the World Bank and others on the outstanding institutional capacity building needs within the Afghan land Authority (Arazi);
- \* inform GIROA stakeholders<sup>3</sup> on the possibilities for replicating the model of upgrading and formalization of informal settlement developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad; and
- \* Inform USAID Afghanistan on recommendations for future assistance in the Afghan land reform process.

### XV. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The questions to answer, in order of priority, are as follows:

#### **Systems & Sustainability:**

8. Have the land management/administrative system upgrades improved functionality for Arazi? If so, how? If not, what were the obstacles?

---

<sup>3</sup> The GIROA stakeholders include Afghan Geodesy and Cartography Head Office (AGCHO), Afghan Land Authority (Arazi); Independent Directorate of Local Governance (IDLG), Ministry of Urban Development Affairs (MUDA), and Jalalabad Municipality.

9. What are the perceptions of the officials and staff of the advantages/disadvantages of the new systems?
10. How will Arazi maintain the systems and sustain operational efficiency and scaling once LARA assistance is completed?

**Upgrading and Formalization:**

11. What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements model developed by the LARA project in Jalalabad? Are there opportunities for replicating this model in other cities of Afghanistan?

**Capacity Building:**

12. How are the trainees using the skills they gained from the LARA-sponsored training?

**Land Market Framework:**

13. How did LARA affect the land market framework<sup>4</sup> that encourages economic growth?

**Gender and outreach:**

14. How has awareness of women's land rights and inheritance changed as a result of LARA's public information campaigns?
15. What were the results of LARA sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?

According to the SOW, the evaluation team will be sure that the recommendations section of the report focuses on action USAID and other donors, such as the World Bank, can take to further strengthen the land market framework and address the institutional capacity needs of Arazi.

## **XVI. METHODOLOGY**

The evaluation team's strategy includes a mix of qualitative and quantitative data collection and analysis approaches. The evaluation team will have access to a variety of program implementation documents and reports. Since LARA is in the process of shutting down, measures must be taken to mitigate lack of access and materials. We will strive to aggregate the disparate remaining materials and to disaggregate all data collected and presented in the evaluation report by gender and geography.

Methods will include those described below.

**Document Review**

- p) LARA Scope Of Work
- q) LARA Work Plans
- r) Quarterly Reports
- s) Annual Reports
- t) Current PMP and other M&E documents,
- u) Midterm Evaluation Report
- v) Related documents researched or received from other projects and on the Internet

**Interviews and consultations with key informants**

- s) Key interviews with USAID/Afghanistan's OEGI Staff;
  - t) Interviews with Mayor and Municipal Officials in Jalalabad;
-

- u) Interviews with key staff in Arazi, AGCHO, IDLG/GDMA, MUDA, and Supreme Court;
- v) Interviews with related projects conducted by UN Habitat;
- w) Interviews with implementing partner staff in Kabul;
- x) Interviews with MOWA and the Afghan Women’s Network and with the members of the women’s task force working with Arazi.

**Focus group discussions:** The evaluation team will seek to facilitate focus group discussions with the following groups; if not practically feasible to form groups, individual interviews will be conducted instead.

- b) a) Trainees, as a means of understanding their experience and usefulness of the training and capacity development efforts (especially useful due to the potential that training materials will not be available)
- c) b) Residents of Araban and Campoona settlements in Jalalabad

### Data Analysis

- c) Project performance data (from USAID)

The chart below shows which methods will be used to answer each evaluation question.

Questions	Document Review	Interviews - Donors	Interviews - J'bad officials	Interviews/ FGDs Arazi	Interviews - other GIRoA	Interviews -Tetra Tech	Interviews/ FGDs - settlements
1. Land management upgrades improved functionality?	x	x	x	x	x	x	
2. Perceptions of new systems?		x	x	x	x		
3. Maintenance and sustainability of new system?	x		x	x		x	
4. What are the strengths/ weaknesses of the upgrading and formalization of informal settlements?	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
5. How are the trainees using the skills they learned?			x	x	x	x	
6. How did LARA affect the land market framework	x	x	x	x	x	x	
7. How has awareness of women’s land rights and inheritance changed?		x	x	x	x	x	x
8. What were the results of LARA sponsored activities according to women beneficiaries?	x		x	x		x	x

**Team roles:** In the conduct of our evaluation, Michel Brunet will take leading responsibility for work regarding registration and surveying and strategies for sustaining their results. Allen Decker and Arif Niazi will have responsibility for analysis of LARA’s training and capacity development work. Basir Malikzaik will coordinate the logistics and calendar for the evaluation team and will specialize in legal analysis. Ms. Momand and Allen Decker will be responsible for LARA’s gender work. In most instances, interviews and meetings will be conducted by the full evaluation team, or by pairing an expat with a local specialist. Interviews or focus group discussions with residents of informal settlements will be led by local consultants in Pashto.

## XVII. EVALUATION TEAM COMPOSITION

The Evaluation Team shall include evaluation and technical specialists with relevant experience particularly in land reform management or urban development in a conflict/post-conflict country. The team shall include at least two objective, independent international experts and two high level Afghan experts with strong interpersonal and writing skills, and cultural awareness. Final selection of the members of the Evaluation Team is subject to agreement by the SUPPORT II Contracting Officer's Representative (COR), the USAID Contracts Officer (CO), and Checchi's SUPPORT II management team.

**Decker, Allen.** Team Leader  
Cell phone 0729 001 690 (Kabul)  
U.S. Phone +1 816 246.1174  
Cell phone +1 816 529.8415 (U.S)  
Email [allendecker2020@gmail.com](mailto:allendecker2020@gmail.com)  
Web [www.allendecker.org](http://www.allendecker.org)

**Brunet, Michel.** Technical Consultant  
Cell phone 0729 001 689 (Kabul)  
U.S. Phone (518) 834.2075  
Cell phone (514) 594.0970 (Canada)  
Email [michel.mich.brunet@gmail.com](mailto:michel.mich.brunet@gmail.com)

**Bazir Malikzai,** Technical Consultant  
Cell phone 0729 001 693 (Kabul)  
Email [basir76@hotmail.com](mailto:basir76@hotmail.com)

**M. Arif Niazi,** Technical Consultant  
Cell phone 072 920 5105 (Kabul)  
Email [arif\\_n2008@hotmail.com](mailto:arif_n2008@hotmail.com)

**Mussarat Arif Momand,** LTTA Gender and Evaluation Specialist  
Cell phone 0776-471-487 (Kabul)  
Email [marif@checchiconsulting.com](mailto:marif@checchiconsulting.com)

## XVIII. EVALUATION SCHEDULE

### **Oct 13 - 16**

*Monday 13 October*

- Allen Decker arrives in Kabul

*Tuesday, 14 October*

- Michel Brunet arrives in Kabul
- Basir Malikzai joins evaluation team
- 4pm **In-Briefing Meeting with USAID**

*Wednesday, 15 October*

- Set-up Master Contacts List and Shared Drive
- Draft list of documents requested from LARA

*Thursday, 16 October*

- 10am **Meeting with Nigel Thomson, LARA COP**

**Oct 18 - 23**

*Saturday, 18 October*

- Work in team office to organize calendar of work, review documents, set-up database of documents
- Research Contacts List and make appointments in Kabul

*Sunday, 19 October*

- 10am **Meeting with Geoplanning**
- **Complete Draft Work Plan**
- Research Contacts List and make appointments in Kabul
- Review CD of documents received from LARA
- Arif Niazi joins evaluation team

*Monday, 20 October*

- **Meeting with MAIL**
- 2pm **Meeting with Peikar, head of Arazi**

*Tuesday, 21 October*

- 9am Meeting with LARA team
- Meeting with DUDA

*Wednesday, 22 October*

- Meeting with MOWA
- Meeting with MUDA

*Thursday, 23 October*

- Meeting with IDLG

*Saturday, 25 October*

- Inspect the ALRMIS database at Arazi

*Sunday, 26 October*

- Meeting with GDMA

*Tuesday, 28 October*

- USAID Mid-Term Review

**Nov 1 – 6: JALALABAD TRIP**

*Saturday, 1 November*

- Local specialists travel to Jalalabad

*Sunday, 2 November*

- Allen and Michel travel to Jalalabad
- Local specialists conduct Campoona Focus groups

*Monday, 3 November (Ashura)*

- Evaluation team conducts Araban focus groups for CDC and women

*Tuesday, 4 November*

- Meeting with DUDA
- Meeting with Jalalabad Arazi

*Sunday, 9 November*

- Mtng with Asta Olesen, World Bank

*Tuesday, 11 November*

- Michel leaves Kabul

*Saturday, 15 November*

- **Exit Presentation for USAID**

*Tuesday, 18 November*

- Allen leaves Kabul

*Saturday, 22 November*

- Draft report

## ANNEX III: BIBLIOGRAPHY OF DOCUMENTS REVIEWED

Arazi, Gender Equity Policy and Action Plan of ARAZI (the Independent Land Authority of Afghanistan (Kabul: Arazi, 2014)

Cecchi Consulting/Afghanistan SUPPORT-II Project, USAID Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Project, Mid-term Evaluation Report (February 2013).

Eureka Research. Final Report. Provision of Monitoring & Evaluation Services for Public and Information and Awareness Activities (February 9, 2013)

Peace Humanitarian Organization (PHO). Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA), Socio-economic & Housing Baseline Survey in Selected Settlements in Jalalabad (April 30, 2012)

Stanfield, J.D, Jennifer Brick Murtaashvili, M.Y. Safar and Akram Salam Community Documentation of Land Tenure and Its Contribution to State-Building in Afghanistan

USAID Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Project

-----

Listed below is the directory of reports consulted and reviewed by the LARA Final Evaluation Team as received from Nigel Thompson, LARA COP, on a CD entitled “Lara Project Files, October 18, 2014.” All of the files are in .pdf format. The reports listed do not include the LARA PMP Reports, LARA Work Plans and LARA Close-out Plans (which were included on the LARA Project Files CD).

### **Annual Reports**

- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Annual Report, January 30, 2011–January 29, 2012
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Annual Report, January 30, 2012–January 29, 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Annual and Quarterly Report, January 1, 2013–March 31, 2014

### **Quarterly Reports**

- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Quarterly Report, January–March 2011
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Quarterly Report (3rd Quarter), April– June 2011
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Quarterly Report (4th Quarter), July-September 2011
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (2nd Quarter), January–March 2012
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (3rd Quarter FY 2012), April–June 2012
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (4th Quarter FY 2012), July-September 2012
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (1st Quarter FY 2013), October-December 2012



- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (2nd Quarter FY 2013), January–March 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (Third Quarter FY 2013), April–June 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (Third Quarter FY 2013), July–September 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (First Quarter FY 2014), October–December 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (The LARA Project) Quarterly Report (Third Quarter FY 2013), July–September 2013
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Annual and Quarterly Report, January 1, 2013–March 31, 2014
- Land Reform in Afghanistan (LARA) Annual and Quarterly Report, April 1, 2014–June 30, 2014

#### **Short-Term Consultant Reports**

- Ahmad October 2014
- Arancibia-January 2013
- De La Cerda-June 2014
- Eden-June 2011
- Gebremedhin-May 2013
- Goode-May 2011
- Grecu-November 2011
- Grecu-December 2013
- Grecu-May 2014
- Haynes-February 2013
- Jerslid-July 2014
- Kimball-June 2011
- McCann-June 2013
- McHugh-September 2011
- McHugh-February 2012
- McHugh-October 2013
- McHugh-October 2014
- McPhee-July 2012
- McPhee-December 2012
- Powell-July 2014
- Roth-April 2012
- Sanderson-July 2013
- Sanderson-September 2014
- Samuel-November 2013
- Smith-April 2013
- Smith-May 2014
- Talash October 2014
- Taylor-August 2011
- Taylor-October 2013
- Taylor-July 2014
- Thomson-October 2011
- Thomson-May 2012

- Thomson-August 2012
- Thomson-February 2013
- Thomson-August 2013
- Thomson-December 2013
- Thomson-July 2014
- Thomson-October 2014
- Valentina-September 2011

### **Other Report/Products**

- **Surveys / Assessments**
  - Partner Institutional Assessment (April 2012)
  - Socio-economic & Housing Baseline (PHO, April 2012)
  - Public Information Awareness Review (Eureka Research, February 2013)
- **Community-Based Dispute Resolution**
  - CBDR Guidelines (2012)
  - Guidelines Dissemination Report
  - Land Disputes, Justice and Dispute Resolution in Jalalabad (April 2012)
  - Tasfia Report (Smith February 2013)
- **Gender**
  - Gender Assessment (April 2012)
  - Evaluation of Legislation affecting Women (June 2012)
  - Gender Mainstreaming Report (February 2013)
  - Desk Review of Women's Land rights in Afghanistan (ECW)
- **IT Systems**
  - ALRMIS BAA
  - ALRMIS SDD
  - CDMS BAA
  - CDMS SDD
  - DRACS BAA
  - DRACS SDD
  - LARA IT Completion Plan (August 2013)
  - SDK Training Manuals
  - GRM Registry and GRM Cadastre Training Manuals
  - ALRMIS & Open Title Training Manuals
  - Index & scanning Process & Procedures Manual
  - Strategic IT Plan
- **Training**
  - Training Assessment Report (May 2012)
- **Urban Planning**
  - Informal Settlement Upgrading Handbook
  - Urban Development Guidelines
  - Draft Urban Upgrading Policy
  - Legal Aspects of urban Planning (1)
  - Designing a Framework for Urban Planning in Afghanistan
  - Jalalabad City Profile
  - Hisar I Shahi Industrial Park Feasibility Report (February 2013)
  - Araban Urban Assessment

- Road Maintenance Plans
- **Formalization & Upgrading**
  - Land Rights and Upgrading Formalization Manual
  - Cadastral Mapping Final Report for Araban and Campoona (Geo Planning, 2013)

## ANNEX IV: SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS

Meetings Conducted by the LARA Evaluation Team - Listed Alphabetically by Organization							
Mtg #	Date	Organization	Name	Title	Phone	Email	Notes
1	22-Oct-14	Afghan Women's Network (AWN)	Mahbooba Siraj	Director	93 (0) 7991 169 41	<a href="mailto:mahboubaseraj@yahoo.com">mahboubaseraj@yahoo.com</a>	
2	29.Oct.2014	AGCHO	Amanullah Afshari	Policy and Planning Chief Executive	93 776 952 218	<a href="mailto:am.afshari@yahoo.com">am.afshari@yahoo.com</a>	
3	3.Nov.2014	Araban Shura	The women's council				
4	20.Oct.2014	Arazi	Jawad Peikar	CEO	93 (0) 794291111	<a href="mailto:jawad.peikar@arazi.gov.af">jawad.peikar@arazi.gov.af</a>	
			Wahidullah Attahi	Operation Director	93 (0) 794100465	<a href="mailto:wahid.attahi@arazi.org.af">wahid.attahi@arazi.org.af</a>	
5	21.Oct.2014	Arazi	Ghulam Eshan Sultani	Director of Survey and Cadastre	0799 460 625		
6	11.Nov.2014	Arazi	Jawad Peikar	CEO	93 (0) 794291111	<a href="mailto:jawad.peikar@arazi.gov.af">jawad.peikar@arazi.gov.af</a>	
			Wahidullah Attahi	Operation Director	93 (0) 794100465	<a href="mailto:wahid.attahi@arazi.org.af">wahid.attahi@arazi.org.af</a>	
7	22.Oct.2014	Arazi	Ahmad Farid Mangal	Manager GIS & ILS	93 700 142 002	<a href="mailto:ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af">ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af</a>	
			Mohammad Alauddin	LARA IT specialist	93 790 055 533	-	
8	11.Nov.2014	Arazi	Arifullah Arif	Legal Specialist	93 744 811 049	<a href="mailto:arif.atal@gmail.com">arif.atal@gmail.com</a>	
			Mohammad Khalid Bahrami	Legal Specialist	93 799 561 032	<a href="mailto:khalid.bahrami@gmail.com">khalid.bahrami@gmail.com</a>	
			Gul Rahman Totakhel	Legal Specialist	93 799 237 432	<a href="mailto:gulrahman.totakhel@arazi.org.af">gulrahman.totakhel@arazi.org.af</a>	
9	11.Nov.2014	Arazi	Ahmad Farid Mangal	Manager GIS & ILS	93 700 142 002	<a href="mailto:ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af">ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af</a>	
			Soliman	Technical manager of data registration		-	
10	11.Nov.2014	Arazi	Arazi Female Staff			-	
11	4.Nov.2014	Arazi Jalalabad	Wagma Zalmai	Admin & finance			
12	4.Nov.2014	Arazi Jalalabad	Eng.Mohammad Sadiq Dawlatzai	Head of Arazi	93 (0) 771 115 111		
13	2.Nov.2014	Campoona Shura	The women's council				
14	05.Nov.2014	DUDA	Eng.Aminullah	Deputy director	93 (0) 700.623749		
15	19.Oct.2014	Geoplanning Company	Jawed Rahimi	Country Director	93 787 872 000	<a href="mailto:mzahir_shaker@yahoo.com">mzahir_shaker@yahoo.com</a>	
			Zaher Sultani	Manager	93(0)705168815	<a href="mailto:Zaher.sultani@yahoo.com">Zaher.sultani@yahoo.com</a>	
16	25.Oct.2014	IDLG	Popal	Director General of Municipal affairs	93 (0) 798284724	<a href="mailto:abpopal.70@gmail.com">abpopal.70@gmail.com</a>	
			Ahmad Farid Azizi	Supervisor to the Planning & Development Unit	93 (0) 788444546	<a href="mailto:himsazizi@gmail.com">himsazizi@gmail.com</a>	
17	26.Oct.2014	Kabul Polytechnic University	Mohammad Anwar Siraj	Director of Survey Department	93 705 168 815	<a href="mailto:anwarsiraj@gmail.com">anwarsiraj@gmail.com</a>	
			Saher Sultani	Professor in GIS and GPS		<a href="mailto:Zaher.sultani@yahoo.com">Zaher.sultani@yahoo.com</a>	
18	21.Oct.2014	LARA	Nigel Thomson	CEO	8026583890	<a href="mailto:nigel.thomson@teratech.com">nigel.thomson@teratech.com</a>	
			Habibullah Hotak	Senior Legal Specialist	788886909	-	

			Rahim Gul	Monitoring and Evaluation	789105266	-	
19	10.Nov.2014	MOWA	Muzhgan Mustafavi	Technical and Policy Deputy	202200507	<a href="mailto:mojgan.mustafavi@gmail.com">mojgan.mustafavi@gmail.com</a>	
20	05.Nov.2014	Municipality of Jalalabad	Eng.Hakimuddin Omarkhel	Deputy Mayor	700600080		
21	09.Nov.2014	RAMPUP	Eng.Hidayatullah jalali	Engineer	798560502		
22	22.Oct.2014	TERRA Institute	Yasin Safar	Cadastral Surveyor	93 799 218 611	<a href="mailto:yasin.safar@gmail.com">yasin.safar@gmail.com</a>	
23	27.Oct.2014	UN-Habitat	Eng.Mohammad Rahman	National Project Manager	93 700 285 081	<a href="mailto:mohammad.rahman@unhabitat-afg.org">mohammad.rahman@unhabitat-afg.org</a>	
24	05.Nov.2014	Urban Court Jalalabad	Mohammad Rahim	Judge	93 (0) 797 499 889		
25	9.Nov.2014	World Bank	Asta Olesen	Senior Social Development Specialist	93 701 133 399	<a href="mailto:aolesen@worldbank.org">aolesen@worldbank.org</a>	

## ANNEX V: DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS

### *LARA FINAL EVALUATION* **TRAINING SURVEY FORM**

Date:

Organization:

City:

Your job title:

Subject of the Training?

When was it conducted?

Who were the trainers?

How many participants were there in the training session?

How long did the training last?

1. That did you learn in the training?
2. Did you learn specific skills? What were they?
3. Was the training directly helpful in your job?
4. What was best about the training?
5. How could it have been improved?
6. Did you receive training materials? Were they in your own language?
7. Have you referred to the training materials after the training session?
8. Was the trainer/facilitator well organized and prepared?
9. Were his/her explanations clear and complete?
10. What other subjects do you need training in?
11. Did the training team visit you after the training to see how effective their training was and whether you were using it in your work?
11. Was the training good, better or worse than other trainings you have had?
12. Do you have any other comments?

## **QUESTIONS FOR FOCUS GROUPS**

**Today's date:**

**Organization:**

1. What is the title of your current job?

What grade is it?

2. How did you get your job?

(Through a friend? Through a relative? Answered an advertisement? Through a Job Fair? Internal promotion?)

3. Were you given a job description when you were hired? Were you asked to sign it?

4. How does your actual work compare with the job description? Please describe any differences.

5. Do you have the skills you need to perform your job? What additional skills do you need?

Were you given job training? (If yes, please complete the training evaluation)

5. Has your supervisor held a performance evaluation on you? When was it? Were you asked to discuss it and sign it?

7. Have you been promoted? (If yes, when? And to what job and grade?)

8. Do you receive your pay on time?

9. Have you ever filed a complaint or an appeal? (If yes, what was it about? What was the decision?)

10. What do you think you will be doing one year from now? Two years from now?

## **QUESTIONS FOR WOMEN PARTICIPANTS**

Have you ever ...

- Been promoted?
- Been subjected to sexual harassment at work?
- Filed a complaint or appeal? (If so, what happened?)



*LARA FINAL EVALUATION*  
**FORMALIZATION AND UPGRADING  
FOCUS GROUP STATEMENTS**

Date:

Settlement:

CDC Leader:

Number of CDC Participants (pass around a list to sign):

Number of participants in the Women's council:

Eval. Team Participants:

---

**Introductory remarks** – Who we are and what we are doing

- Final Evaluation of the USAID/LARA Project's work with your community
- Follow-up to our meeting with you 1 ½ years ago
- Purposes: measure successes, identify lessons learned and recommendations for future work

**Guideline Questions**

What have LARA and (your community) achieved together? What are our successes?

What specific upgrading projects have been completed? (List them fully)  
Were they well done?

Did your community participate in their completion? (As volunteers? As contractors?)

How could LARA have better worked with you?

Did your **Women's Council** participate in suggesting projects? Help to prioritize the projects? Involved in completing the projects?

How could LARA have better worked with your Women's Council?

## **Results**

Did LARA come to examine and discuss the results with you?

Is your community happy with the results?

## **Future Work to Upgrade**

What other projects do you suggest or need?

What was (your community's) experience with other donors helping you with upgrading?  
(UNHabitat, DFID, RampUp)

Do you feel that (your community) now has the ability to work together and work with the city of Jalalabad and donors to do more upgrading work?

Does your Community Development Council listen to all members of your community and conduct its business democratically?

## **Land Tenure Issues**

What percentage of your community has customary title to your real estate property?

What percentage is paying tasfia taxes (has a tasfia booklet)?

What percentage has a registered deed to show ownership of their property?

Why have most people not gone to the trouble to get a registered deed?

**\*\*\* Thank the group for their time and help \*\*\***

## **After the CDC Discussion:**

Tour the community (pay particular attention to LARA upgrade projects)

Photograph completed projects, outstanding problems  
(Take photos that tell the story and "people photos")

**Focus groups conducted in J-BAD (LARA Evaluation Team)**

			<i>Questionnaire</i>																			
No.	Date	Name	Job	Location	Sex	Q.1: What have LARA and (your community) achieved together? What are our successes?	Q.2: What specific upgrading projects have been completed? (List them fully)Were they well done?	Q.3: Did your community participate in their completion? (As volunteers? As contractors?)	Q.4: How could LARA have better worked with you?	Q.5: Did your Women's Council participate in suggesting projects? Help to prioritize the projects? Involved in completing the projects?	Q.6: How could LARA have better worked with your Women's Council?	Q.7: Did LARA come to examine and discuss the results with you?	Q.8: Is your community happy with the results?	Q.9: What other projects do you suggest or need?	Q.10: What was (your community's) experience with other donors helping you with upgrading? (UNHabitat, DFID, RampUp)	Q.10: Do you feel that (your community) now has the ability to work together and work with the city of Jalalabad and donors to do more upgrading work?	Q.11: Does your Community Development Council listen to all members of your community and conduct its business democratically?	Q.12: What percentage of your community has customary title to your real estate property?	Q.13: What percentage is paying tasfia taxes (has a tasfia booklet)?	Q.14: What percentage has a registered deed to show ownership of their property?	Q.15: Why have most people gone to the trouble to get a registered deed?	Other suggestions
3	2	1																				
2.11.2014	2.11.2014	2.11.2014	Zakir	Zalmai	Male	We had no achievement with LARA project	Our Road is paved and this is a good achievement.	LARA Project has Paved some of the roads but some are left dirt. This project should work more on Electricity, more roads, and water for drinking.	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Community Member	Community Member	CDC Leader	Campoona	Campoona	Male	No upgrading project in our place	Roads and runnels are built in our area.	Only Roads have been paved and some roads are left raw.	Our community has actively participate and cooperate with the LARA project employees as volunteers.	We demand more projects in our community, for Health, Electricity and roads	LARA project should have given trainings on tailoring and health for women	Lara Project has done very good job in our area ad we are happy with the results	Yes our community is very happy with the results of LARA project	The streets that are left dirt should be paved, and they should work for electricity and drinking water for the community.	None of other donors have helped our community because we have very poor people living here, we didn't have the percentage to give to UN-Habitat to Pave our roads, so we want LARA to design some more projects for our neighborhood and implement it.	Yes	Our CDC has asked all the members of the council and then prioritized projects to be conducted by the LARA	75%	90%	25%	Because this area is out of the Municipality master-plan	
Male	Male	Male	Community Member	Community Member	Community Member	We had no project in our area so we had no contribution or cooperation	we have worked voluntary with them.	Our community has actively participate and cooperate with the LARA project employees as volunteers.	We didn't need anything else from this project.	Don't know	Don't know	Yes they did tell the people while completion of the project and asked	Yes we are very happy with LARA Project	Electricity should be available for all houses, and drinking water should be provided	No other organisation has helped us, UN-Habitat is not a good organisation they ask people for percentage.	m	Yes we take decisions with advice and opinion of the people in the community	75%	95%	25%	Because this area is out of the plan of the municipality	
They could pave our roads, and make footpaths, and upgrade our electricity systems	No	Don't know	No	Don't know	No	Some people are happy but we are not	Water, Roads, Electricity are the main priorities for our area.	No one has ever come to our area for upgrading except for surveying	No answer	Yes they take our advice	almost all	all of them	don't know	because we are illegally residing here								

6	5	4
2.11.2014	2.11.2014	2.11.2014
Sayed Amrullah	Awaz khan	Haji Zarghoon
Community Member	Community Member	Community Member
Campoona	Campoona	Campoona
Male	Male	Male
Most of the streets in Campoona have been paved throughout the LARA project	We have achieved nothing with LARA project	We have achieved nothing with LARA project
Streets and streams	No upgrading project in our place	No upgrading project in our place
yes we worked with the survey teams as volunteers	No	No
To finish all the roads left because its creating conflict in the area	Upgrading of electricity systems, pave the roads	Upgrading of electricity systems, pave the roads
I don't know	No	When men had no part then how could women have a hand in the implementation of the project
Don't know	Don't know	They could give trainings for women on tiling, med-wife training and literacy
Not sure	They did talk to the community leaders about the finishing of the project, wherever they have done upgrading works it looks good, but wherever they haven't then they haven't moved even a single stone from the road	They did talk to the community leaders about the finishing of the project, wherever they have done upgrading works it looks good, but wherever they haven't then they haven't moved even a single stone from the road
somehow yes	NO	NO
To finish the existing surveyed roads and get them paved	Electricity, Roads, Canals, and trainings for awareness	Electricity, Roads, Canals, and trainings for awareness
don't know about the other donors helping our community	At our neighborhood we haven't seen them coming but other streets yes, they have got benefit of other donors investing.	At our neighborhood we haven't seen them coming but other streets yes, they have got benefit of other donors investing.
we did volunteerly work with them to help them.	We would cooperate with the municipality but they don't bring projects to our place	We would cooperate with the municipality but they don't bring projects to our place
yes they discuss issues with us	They take advice but we still don't get a share in the projects	They take advice but we still don't get a share in the projects
All houses	almost all	almost all
mostly houses	I don't have	I don't have
not sure	not more than 1 %	not more than 1 %
we never applied because we know that they will take our time and money and will ask us to wait for long time with	The municipality won't give it because it is not our own property	The municipality won't give it because it is not our own property

10	9	8	7
3.11.2014	3.11.2014	3.11.2014	2.11.2014
Asluddin	Haji Asadullah	Haji Malik Sardar Mohammad	Mohammad Saleem
Deputy Leader of CDC of 2nd district	Head of CDC of 2rd district	Head of CDC of 3rd district	Community Member
Araban	Araban	Araban	Campoona
Male	Male	Male	Male
we had no positive achievement, we are just having conflict with the people because of the LARA project	We had no achievement and we faced many problems with LARA project	We have not got a single benefit from the LARA project	LARA has not functioned in our area
This project was implemented by the wish of the engineer working here not the people	This project was implemented by the wish of the engineer working here not the people	The project has not completed, and all upgrading works are left at the middle,	Nothing in our neighborhood
People worked as volunteer with them all the time	People worked as volunteer with them all the time	We were with the LARA project since the starting, we have attending all the meetings and workshops, but when the actual work in the area started we had no awareness and control over that so the roads have been built with a	no
without advice and discussion with people the project has been implemented	without advice and discussion with people the project would give such result	with the help and opinion of the people any project can give fruitful result	Pave our roads too like the other roads
they have just given one day training to women's council	Women's councils had participation in the events of the project but they got no benefit	The Women's Councils had very good participation in the workshops and other activities of the project but when the project started in here the women were not even aware of it to prioritize anything	No only the engineers of the project had a say in the planning and the implementation of the project
	To the women's council of 2nd district in araban we need tailoring courses for the women, but no stipend or compensation was allocated for women	the project should have been implemented with cooperation of the both men and women's councils so that the people had a share in the project this way only it could reach to success	Don't know
	everyone has come, started the work with no discussion with the people so they collapsed	We didn't get anything about the completion of the project, any news any gathering nothing	I don't know
	no we are not happy	our people are very unhappy with this project	No
		we have requested LARA for many projects while our meetings	they should pave our roads, make our electricity systems, and our water pumps
we want 1000 meters of road paved 1st, and want them to install garbage containers in our area	we want 1000 meters of road paved 1st, and want them to install garbage containers in our area	Our people are more happy with the UN-Habitat's works in our area	no one helped us
		We need a lot of work at our community and we are ready to cooperate with any donor who is interested to help us	The municipality don't know us as a legal place, only some donors come but leave the work unfinished
		Yes	yes the CDC discusses the issues with us
		80%	Everyone
		100%	Everyone
		20%	No one
		through our area is agricultural land so while applying for the deed we face problems	We will not get a deed from the court according to the plan of the municipality

14	13	12	11
3.11.2014	3.11.2014	3.11.2014	3.11.2014
Qari Mohammad Hussain	Ehsanullah Aziz	Dr.Saber	Toryalay
Head of the CDC	Member of the CDC 2nd district	Head of the CDC	Member of the CDC
Arabian	Arabian	Arabian	Arabian
Male	Male	Male	Male
The LARA project has done nothing in our community	The LARA project has done nothing in our community	we have no good memory from the LARA project this project has created big problems for th people	We have no positive achievement
no upgrading project has took place in our community, if there is some then they are not completed or low quality	no upgrading project has took place in our community, if there is some then they are not completed or low quality	This project was implemented by the wish of the engineer working here not the people	This project was implemented by the wish of the engineer working here not the people
yes our people worked as volunteers with them	yes our people worked as volunteers with them	we have worked and helped them as volunteers	we have worked and helped them as volunteers
what we suggested to the project they didn't listen to us, and they did some work unfinished, and some with real bad quality	what we suggested to the project they didn't listen to us, and they did some work unfinished, and some with real bad quality	the engineers worked without consulting of our CDC	without advice and discussion with people the project has been implemented
Yes our women's council was present while desiding projects but in the field none of them happened	Yes our women's council was present while desiding projects but in the field none of them happened	we do have women's council but this project has not consulted with them	they have just given one day training to women's council
they LARA project should have worked according to the needs and advice of the women's councils in our area, the promises that they made for women's councils were all broken	they LARA project should have worked according to the needs and advice of the women's councils in our area	There has been no help with the women's councils, but they should provide them tailoring trainings and equipments	They should help the women's councils in Arabian
no	No	The have not shared the result of the project with us	The have not shared the result of the project with us
No	our people are very unhappy with this project	Our people are very unhappy with this project	no we are not happy
we need streams and we need garbage containers to collect the dust in one place and services in medical	we need streams and we need garbage containers to collect the dust in one place	every project should be shared with the CDC and should be implemented with the help of CDCs in any area	any project that works clean for the benefit of the community we would want it
UN-Habitat is better than LARA project	UN-Habitat is better than LARA project	UN-Habitat is better than LARA project	This project didn't disclose its budget to us so that we could monitor it, and they did anything they want
we will try our best to cooperate with the municipality and the donors, so that our community go towards development	Yes our community is ready to work with any donor	we are ready to go to any province in afghanistan and work as volunteer if the work is for good.	we are ready to go to any province in afghanistan and work as volunteer if the work is for good.
Yes they all discuss with people then take decision	yes we work with consultation of our people	we 1st take opinion of the people then decide to do anything	we 1st take opinion of the people then decide to do anything
100%	90%	all of the people in 2nd district	all of the people in 2nd district
100%	50%	all of the people in 2nd district pay (safay) tax to the municipality	all of the people in 2nd district pay (safay) tax to the municipality
100%	10%	not even 1%	not even 1%
because of the economic problems		all of the 2nd district need deeds	we the 2nd district residents need legal registered deeds

## ANNEX VI: DETAILED MEETING NOTES (CONSOLIDATED)

*USAID LARA Final Evaluation – Checchi Support II Team*

### MEETING REPORT 1 AFGHAN WOMEN'S NETWORK

**Date** : 22 October 2014      **Starting Time:** 2:00pm  
**Reporter:** Allen Decker      **Place (organization and address):** Support II office

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)

- Mahboba Saraj, Afghan Women's Network

**LARA Eval Team attending** (circle): Decker Mussarat

#### Meeting Objective(s)

Get her perspective on LARA's gender work—what it has achieved and recommendations for future gender work

**Agenda** (*Attached: Yes/No*)

#### Discussion

Ms. Saraj is an energetic, fluent Afghan-American. She has lived in Afghanistan for the past 11 years and is actively involved in civil society initiatives and women's rights issues. She was vocally critical of the LARA billboard campaign, echoing the critique of the February 2013 Eureka Research study. According to her, featuring a young woman was wrong; men or older women should have been shown. The message was too implied, which limited understanding in rural viewers. The messages should have been more direct, even showing the bad results of women's loss of access to the land. Most of all, she questioned the cost-effectiveness of the campaign, which produced little result (the number of petitioners for help from MOW were too few and the impact of the awareness campaign was too diffuse in view of the expense.) She questioned the focus on Kabul only and thought that that future campaigns might better focus on talk shows and village "skit" presentations that would have greater impact on common villagers and would be more understandable to the illiterate. In general, she thought that LARA's campaign for women's land rights has had little impact. She also expressed her concern that the upcoming PROMOTE project will lack focus and impact and that its results will be modest and too diffuse.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

Meet with MOWA to hear their assessment and survey their current activities.

#### Documents or resources required

McClatchy DC article on the LARA campaign for women's land inheritance rights

#### Misc. Notes

CC: Aimee Rose

**MEETING REPORT 2**  
**AGCHO**

**Date** : October 29, 2014

Starting Time: 10:00 AM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Place : AGCHO, Kabul

**Attendee: Amanullah Afshari**

Policy & Planning Chief Executive

AFGHAN GEODESY & CARTOGRAPHY HEAD OFFICE

+93 (0) 776952218

[aman@agcho.gov.af](mailto:aman@agcho.gov.af)

[am.afshari@yahoo.co](mailto:am.afshari@yahoo.co)

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Brunet Basir

**Meeting Objective(s):** Overview of AGCHO organization

**FINDINGS:**

AGCHO has now around 520 employees, whereas they used to have around 700 with the Cadastral Department.

Mr. Afshari has 35 years of experience working at AGCHO. Mr Afshari gave us a copy of the MOU signed on October 31 2011 by USAID and MUDA, AGCHO and IDLG.

Concerning the training at AGCHO by LARA, it did not take place. It might have taken place with the cadastral Department, but since that department is now with Arazi, he does not know if it happened or not. Mr. Afshari wrote a letter to USAID on April 2014 asking for the reports on the training done by LARA for the Cadastral Department. He is still waiting for a response from USAID.

Mr. Afshari is not pleased with the presidential decree that authorized the transfer of the Cadastral Department from AGCHO to Arazi. He thinks that in the future Arazi should be part of AGCHO.

The Japanese firm JICA did the digital mapping at the scale of 1:5000 of the greater Kabul. It is the only digital map in Afghanistan. Other maps available are at the scale of 1:10,000 1:25,000 and 1:50,000 (topo). Analog maps have been digitized. They have since 1969 established all over the country geodetic network of 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> order. They have an ongoing program of densification of the geodetic networks.

They use aerial photography. They used to fly their own airplanes and took aerial photos with their own cameras. The budget does not permit those expenses now. They also use satellite imagery. Their field geodesy work is done mainly using TRIMBLE GPS equipment. They need to update their 1:25000 and 1:50000 maps. They would like to have a project to do so.



They also need more survey equipment, (Total Stations, GPS) and printers for maps. They need training in photogrammetry, geodesy and cartography. They currently have a joint project with Iran to delineate the boundaries between the two countries.

Personnel at AGCHO was instrumental in the 70's in having the Kabul Polytechnic University start a Survey Department within the University.

## **CONCLUSION**

If AGCHO stays on its own, it will further deteriorate. Their joining Arazi should be something to contemplate in a near future since Arazi needs help to accomplish its large rural and urban tasks.

**MEETING REPORT 3**  
**WOMEN'S SHURA - ARABAN**

**Date:** 3, Nov, 2014

**Starting Time:** 9:00

**Reporter:** Mussarat Arif

**Place (organization and address):** Araban Jalalabad

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)

Women Shura, Araban

**LARA Eval Team attending** (circle): Mussarat

**Meeting Objective(s)**

Meet with Araban Shura to evaluate LARA work

**Agenda** (*Attached: No*)

**Discussion**

Women expressed that the people in Araban did not help LARA in their work voluntarily, but the families used to provide lunch and breakfast to laborers that were busy paving the streets. LARA paved the streets and did good work, but the women complain about the rivulets which are not built well by LARA; water flows directly to household houses when it is raining. LARA pledged that they will return to fix the stream they had destroyed for paving streets, but LARA made no follow-up meetings for evaluation of their results.

The majority of families name their properties after their elder brother's name in the court to show the ownership of their property. It takes much time and money in legal courts for taking formal deed to show individual's ownership. Bribery is the great obstacle that discourages people from having formal documents to show ownership of their land and property.

LARA provided the women with a notebook, but advised nothing that was included in the notebook. They were advised just to keep the notebook at home and do nothing with it. Women mapped their streets and houses in charts for LARA, but the women in Araban did not receive a single workshop or training related to land rights or inheritance.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

**Documents or resources required**

- LARA Gender work in Araban, LARA annual report

**Misc. Notes**

**MEETING REPORT 4  
ARAZI**

**Date** : October 20<sup>th</sup> 2014

**Starting Time:** 2:00PM

**Reporters:** Michel Brunet,

**Place:** Head Office of ARAZI, Kabul

**Attendees:** Jawad Peikar (CEO) Arazi, Wahidullah Attahi (Operation Director Arazi), Allen Decker, Michel Brunet, Basir, Arif Niazi

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir, Arif

**Meeting Objective:** First meeting with Arazi in order to get an overview of the organization

**FINDINGS:**

Arazi is the AFGHANISTAN INDEPENDENT LAND AUTHORITY.

The LARA project according to Jawad Peikar was generally a very successful one.

- He presented his point of view to the LML (Land management Law) had corrections made and it is being sent to Justice for final approval.

Capacity building for the personnel of Arazi was also a success.

The land registration software ALRMIS was designed by Thomson Reuters and Mr. Peikar doubts that it will ever be implemented in its actual format. Neil Porter (?) (FAO) did an initial assessment of ALRMIS at the request of Mr Peikar. Thomson Reuters is asking to be paid to continue on the development of ALRMIS. Mr. Peikar feels that IT (Information Technology) within ARAZI is the tool they need to fight corruption.

Mr. Peikar had a meeting with the new president of Afghanistan (Ashraf Ghani) and the president is pro land reform and makes it its priority.

He prepared a document outlining what Arazi should be: ‘Operational Strategy to Become a Modern Public Land Services Institution.’ It is a five year plan that document calls for the setting up of a High Council of Land chaired by the vice-president of ARAZI and made up of seven members from different Ministries and two leading civil society organization.

Land grabbing is the biggest corruption in Afghanistan. Mr. Peikar is confident that the new laws on land grabbing and LML will be approved by the Cabinet and will become law.

ARAZI does not have good friends within the Government, but has the support of the new President. Mr. Piekar agrees that land reform will come through community involvement. Mr. Piekar is consulting with the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank to fund future land reforms in Afghanistan.

The new slogan for ARAZI is: commitment to social and economic growth. Mr. Piekar would like to see less control or none at all by the Supreme Court over the issuing of title deeds.

ARAZI has 1300 employees, offices in 34 offices provinces and in 350 districts. ARAZI personnel needs better security as they are the target of mercenaries in the land sector. Mr. Piekar keeps a low profile and will not appear on television or participate on radio talk shows. He appealed to the president for assistance in that regard.

The new president was a consultant and not a politician and is very interested in land reform. Mr. Piekar meets with him on a regular basis.

ARAZI is bigger in size than eight ministries.

## **CONCLUSIONS:**

Mr. Piekar presented ARAZI point of view during a 90 minute presentation.

He seems very much in charge and has the support of the new president. His document "Operational Strategy," describes very well the vision ARAZI hopes to take in the future based on the administration and management of land in Afghanistan.

**MEETING REPORT 5**  
**ARAZI (Cadastre)**

**Date** : October 21<sup>st</sup> 2014  
**Reporter:** Michel Brunet,

Starting Time: 11:00AM  
Place: ARAZI BUILDING

**Attendee:** **Ghulam Eshan Sultani**, Director of Survey and Cadastre  
+93(0) 799 460 625  
District #7, Opposite to Darulaman Palace, Kabul, Afghanistan

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective:** First meeting with ARAZI (Cadastre)

**FINDINGS:**

Only the Cadastral Department of the Afghan Geodesy and Cartographic Head Office moved to ARAZI. The Afghan Geodesy and Cartographic continues as a stand-alone organization.

At the time the pilot projects were initiated on informal settlements in Jalalabad, Mr. Sultani was not informed of the project because they were not part of ARAZI at that time. Mr. Sultani will not accept the type of survey that was performed in Jalalabad. and they cannot read the different files from that project. We have been referred to Mr. Yasin Safar who knows why that survey cannot be incorporated into the existing cadastral system in Afghanistan.

Jalalabad is considered an urban survey, and the old cadastral office of AGCHO dealt mainly with rural surveys even though they have the responsibility of urban surveys. This is the reason why they did not get involved.

The Cadastral Department has surveyed 34% of rural lands in Afghanistan. The cadastral Department employs 230 people.

The Survey Department at Kabul Polytechnic University came into existence one year ago with the urging by Mr. Sultani to the Education Department. Mr. Sultani feels confident that the remaining 66% of rural lands can be surveyed using orthographic photos without going in the field. This process could be accomplished in the next 10 years. Mr. Sultani is in agreement also to use orthographic photo for urban surveys.

Aerial photography was made available to them in 2011, 2012 and 2014 from ISAF.

The maps we were shown were from 1970 and paper base. They are only starting now to prepare digital maps. The registry is only hand base.

**CONCLUSIONS:**

It is obvious that Mr. Sultani lost some prestige having to work now under ARAZI.

He would appreciate being consulted any new projects affecting urban surveys, and he will have to approve the standards for survey of informal settlements.

**MEETING REPORT 6  
ARAZI FOLLOW-UP**

**Date** : November 11 2014

Starting Time: 2:30 PM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Place : ARAZI Office

**Attendees:** JawadPeikar, CEO ARAZI; WahidullahAttahi, Operations Director

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective:** Discuss with Mr. Peikar the recommendations from our evaluation

**Findings:**

In the end, ALRMIS software should be modified, corrected and used by ARAZI.

Mr. Peikar suggested to Mr. Ashraf Ghani that The High Council of Land should be chaired by him, instead of the vice-president.

ARAZI is currently into discussions with the Polytechnic University of Kabul for mutual cooperation.

Mr. Peikar endorses the idea of forming associations of real estate brokers, appraisers and land surveyors.

Mr. Peikar endorses also the concept of issuing full ownership to informal settlers after 5 years of undisputed occupation of their land.

Mr. Peikar is looking into the possibility of using easier and faster procedures in land surveying and titling for informal settlements.

Mr. Peikar is interested in looking at other countries' experience in Cadastral Reform Programs such as those taking place in Canada (Province of Quebec), Turkey and Georgia. He is looking at the Japanese model of Land Readjustment Plan to be used for Kabul.

The TASFIA legal process through the Courts system takes too long and should not be used to formalize informal settlements. The passing into law of the Land Management Law and the Anti-Land Grabbing Law should be finalized by December 5<sup>th</sup> 2014

**Discussion**

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

**Documents or resources required**

**Misc. Notes**

**MEETING REPORT 7**  
**ALRMIS**

**Date :** October 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014  
**Reporter:** Abdul Basir

Starting Time: 2:15PM  
Place: ARAZI OFFICE

**Attendees:** Amad Farid Mangal Turyal (Manager GIS & ILS at ARAZI)  
93 (0) 700142002  
[ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af](mailto:ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af)

Mohammad Alauddin (LARA IT Specialist)  
93 (0) 0790055533

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Abdul Basir

**Meeting Objective(s):** to discuss the possibility of using the software ALRMIS in the future.

**FINDINGS:**

- ALRMIS is the software that is to be implemented for the whole country and would incorporate the title deeds, the cadastral maps and other documents from the archive.
- ARAZI has the mandate to keep documents that pertains to the public and private lands in Afghanistan.
- ARAZI is not totally happy with the software ALRMIS Thomson-Reuters installed.
  - The training was not sufficient
  - The hardware was not installed in due course
  - The SDK (Software Development Kit) was not really implemented,
  - The software is not working the way ARAZI want it to work.

Thomson-Reuters wants more money to modify the system to ARAZI's satisfaction.

The modification cost is between \$100,000. 00 and \$300.000 and has to be negotiated with Thomson-Reuters. The reasons given for the software not being up to par are complex and both sides blame the other. A referee is needed to resolve the conflict.

- Thomson-Reuters has similar software in operation in 18 different countries.
- The ALRMIS itself is very good system, but the problem was in data collection and workflow. The solution to problems of ALRMIS is to create workflows and correct the data collection, although data collection is done and sent to Thomson Rueters. In response Thomson Reuters sent their proposal with few hundred thousand dollars which is costly for Arazi.



- Arazi asked for some features and we listed them in workflow and sent them to Thomson Reuters.
- According to the current need of Arazi, ALRMIS can meet the needs, but the Arazi need one program developer who would be familiar with RGIS server, and one GIS specialist. The GIS specialist should take GRM Cadastre Administrator training. The data developer should get the SDK (Software Development Kit) training.
- For permanent problem resolution of ALRMIS, the below several things are needed.
  - Permanent electricity in Arazi offices
  - Permanent GIS specialist and Programmer
  - Long term, inclusive trainings for Arazi IT staff
  - Familiarize the Arazi staff with digital system and abandoning paper usage by the Arazi staff.
- 25 staff of Arazi was trained in ALRMIS system by LARA, and 3 staff in SDK(Software Development Kit) training.

## **CONCLUSIONS**

The software seems to be at a stage where modifications to be done are not that complicated.

The other avenue would be for the GIS & LIS Department to hire an IT person to do the needed modifications themselves.

**MEETING REPORT 8**  
**ARAZI LEGAL TEAM**

**Date** : November, 11<sup>th</sup> 2014  
**Reporter:** Abdul Basir

Starting Time: 01:350PM  
Place: ARAZI OFFICE

**Attendees:** Arifullah Arif (Legal Specialist ARAZI)  
93 (0) 744 811 049  
[arif.atal@gmail.com](mailto:arif.atal@gmail.com)

Mohammad Khalid Bahrami (Legal Specialist ARAZI)  
93 (0) 779 561 032  
[Khalid.bahrami@gmail.com](mailto:Khalid.bahrami@gmail.com)

Gul Rahman Totakhail (Sr. Legal Advisor/Rule of Law Officer)  
93 (0) 799 237 432  
[gulrahman.totakhail@arazi.gov.af](mailto:gulrahman.totakhail@arazi.gov.af)

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Abdul Basir

**Meeting Objective(s):** to discuss the legal framework of ARAZI and how LARA helped Arazi in legal aspects

**FINDINGS**

- Land Management Law (LML) was enacted at 2008, originally this law was the same law which Taliban developed and enacted at 2001, only the Afghanistan Emirates changed to Islamic Republic of Afghanistan nothing else was changed in the content of the law, the 2008 law was not responding to the current requirements of land issues.
- At 2009, *Amlak* was changed to Arazi and the HAKAKAT of DFID opined that a new land law would be written; therefore when LARA started its work, it assisted Arazi in amending LML law.
- While LARR was working on amending LML, Mr. Peikar appointed as Chief Executive Officer of Arazi, he requested that before bringing any amendments to LML, consultative workshops will be conducted in seven zones and different stakeholders like representatives of civil society, private sector, landowners, lawyers and state legal entities would be invited from all provinces to obtain their point of views about new amendments to the LML law. According to Mr. Peikar's request LARA conducted such consultative workshops in all seven zones of Afghanistan and received the opinions of the relevant stakeholders about all amendments.
- On December 18<sup>th</sup>/2012, Arazi submitted the LML to Ministry of Justice (MoJ), the legislative department of MOJ reviewed it, and now it waits in MOJ to be submitted to the cabinet of ministers.

- The Land Acquisition Law (LAL) was source of disagreement and contention between Kabul municipality and MoJ on who is the real owner of this law, therefore MoJ worked for three years on this law but couldn't finalize it.
- When Arazi came to existence, it owned the LAL law and amended it, a legal team comprised of legal specialists from LARA, World Bank, Da Afghanistan Bank, United State Institute of Peace (USIP) and Arazi Legal team worked on amending the LAL. International legal consultants from Malaysia, Washington DC, United Arab Emirates were also involved in amending LAL through conducting videoconferences with them.
- LAL is recently sent to MoJ, it hasn't been reviewed by legislative department of MoJ yet.
- The amendments are brought both in contents and procedures of both Land Management Law (LML) and Land Acquisition Law (LAL).
- The Arazi legal team is pretty optimistic about both LML and LAL would be passed by parliament and the president because the MOJ, new government and president Ghani want these laws should be enacted and there is a strong political will of the new government to enact these laws.
- The Anti- land grabbing law was part of land management law, it was two chapters, one about the grabbers, grabbed land and the second chapter was about the punishments for land grabbing, but the anti-land grabbing parts/chapters were deleted by MoJ, because it wanted these chapters will be removed/deleted. It was strong pressure from land mafia and land grabbers on MOJ to delete the anti-land grabbing parts from LML. LARA's requests to keep the anti-land grabbing provisions to be part of LML were not accepted by MoJ.
- Later on a Commission on Oversight of Government was established in the Parliament, this Commission adopted the two chapters of anti-land grabbing of LML as new Anti-grabbing draft law with some changes, it consists of (20) articles, this new draft law is more flexible, this draft law was passed by Lower House of Parliament and the Upper House didn't pass it because it wanted to bring changes to some of its articles. Now, the draft anti-grabbing law is in joint commission of both Lower and Upper Houses of the parliament to be discussed further.
- The Arazi legal team said “ while amending both LML and LAL, we considered the social, economic and legal conditions/situation of Afghanistan, the amendments are according to national and international standards and we strongly believe that the parliament will pass both laws, only some MPs who are involved in land grabbing and work for land mafia may oppose these laws but majority of parliamentarians will approve both laws”

**MEETING REPORT 9**  
**ALRMIS**

**Date** : October 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014  
**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Starting Time: 2:00PM  
Place: ARAZI OFFICE

**Attendees:** Amad Farid Mangal Turyal (Manager GIS & ILS at ARAZI)  
93 (0) 700142002  
[Ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af](mailto:Ahmadfarid.mangala@arazi.gov.af)

Mohammad Alauddin (LARA IT SPECIALIST)  
93 (0) 0790055533

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Brunet Basir

**Meeting Objective(s):** To focus on ALRMIS software

**FINDINGS:**

ALRMIS signifies Afghan Land Record Management System. It was developed by ILS (International Land System), which was bought by Thomson-Reuters.

ALRMIS is the software that is to be implemented for the whole country and would incorporate the title deeds, the cadastral maps and other documents from the archive. ARAZI has the mandate to keep documents that pertains to the public and private lands in Afghanistan.

ARAZI is not totally happy with the software ALRMIS Thomson-Reuters installed.

- The training was not sufficient
- The hardware was not installed in due course
- The SDK (Software Development Kit) was not really implemented,
- The software is not working the way ARAZI wants it to work.

Thomson-Reuters wants more money to modify the system to ARAZI's satisfaction.

The modification cost is between \$100,000. 00 and \$300.000 and has to be negotiated with Thomson-Reuters. The reasons given for the software not being up to par are complex, and both sides blame the other. A referee is needed to resolve the conflict.

Thomson-Reuters has similar software in operation in 18 different countries.

The software OPEN-TITLE is adequate for the registration of documents in a limited territory but, is not adequate as a system for the whole country.

**MEETING REPORT 10**  
**ARAZI WOMEN STAFF**

**Date:** 11 Nov. 2014

**Starting Time:** 1:00

**Reporter:** Mussarat Arif

**Place (organization and address):** Arazi, Kabul

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)

FGD Arazi female staff

**LARA Eval Team attending** (circle): Basir, Allen, Arif

**Meeting Objective(s)**

FGD Arazi, female staff

**Agenda** (*Attached: No*)

**Discussion**

There were a meeting and also a focus group discussion in Arazi for nine women. During the discussion, the female staff expressed gratitude feelings to LARA for their trainings and assistance. The participants in the focus group discussion had a great deal of experience from highly experienced trainers and appreciated their excellent efforts and methodology.

Some suggested management and IT training to build up their capacity in the world of technology to better help them in their work. Some requested to extend such trainings and awareness, and some other suggested to add more hours in the course on gender matters and other capacity development.

See the attached trackers for details.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

- USAID

**Documents or resources required**

LARA work with Arazi gender

**Misc. Notes**

**CC:** Aimee Rose

**MEETING REPORT 11**  
**ARAZI JALALABAD – WOMEN’S GROUP**

**Date:** 4 Nov,2014

Starting Time: 9:00

**Reporter:** Mussarat Arif

Place (organization and address): Arazi, Jalalabad

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)

Wagma Zalmai, Admin&Finance

**LARA Eval Team attending** (circle): Mussarat Arif and Arif Niazi

**Meeting Objective(s)**

Meeting to review LARA Gender work in Jalalabad

**Agenda** (*Attached: No*)

**Discussion**

Wagma Zalmai works in Administration and Financee for Arazi; she has six years working experience with Arazi but no capacity development opportunities were provided to her for the last six years. Financial work has been handed over to her recently, but she has no working and educational background in the area. LARA discussed Women’s Access to Land, Property, and Inheritance Rights with Arazi female staff as part of their gender work, but the trainings and workshops were provided to men! There were no individual trainings related to awareness of land rights. LARA provided no assistance in the cross-cutting areas of gender. Arazi gender documents explain well the strategy for women, but only female staff of Arazi has no awareness about the gender policy and strategy in Arazi.

Arazi does not facilitate on the job degree courses on land registration, land survey and land association laws for female staff. LARA documents indicate trainings on inheritance that includes land rights and *maher*, whereas Arazi female staff members have no idea about the work of LARA, or that they have done any work in Jalalabad city.

Lack of access to land ownership and property rights is a serious obstacle to Afghan women’s empowerment. Most women are not aware of their rights which results their being silent and not raise their voices for rights. LARA could help to provide assistance to female staff in Arazi. Arazi has no efforts to target women on their board for vacancies and make gender equality atmosphere.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

- Meeting with Kabul Arazi

**Documents or resources required**

Arazi Gender Policy, CHECCHI LARA assessment report, LARA gender work.

**Misc. Notes**

**CC:** Aimee Rose

**MEETING REPORT 12**  
**ARAZI JALALABAD**

**Date** : November 4<sup>th</sup> 2014

Starting Time: 10:00 AM

**Reporter:** Basir

Place: Jalalabad ARAZI Office

**Attendees:** **Eng. Mohammad Sadiq (Dawlatzai),**  
Mr.Habibullah, Head of the Cadastral Department.

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir, Arif, Mussarat

**Meeting Objective: the role of Arazi (Jalalabad) in informal settlements**

- Eng. Mohammad Sadiq ( Dawlatzai), the head of Land Authority Directorate in Jalalabad has managerial role on all components of his directorate, evaluate his staff annually, coordinate Arazi's work with the governor office, protect the government land from grabbing, he supervises the daily work of all staff, advise them and guide them to better perform Arazi's duties.
- He is happy with the annexing of cadastre to Arazi, because he says that the duties of Arazi and cadastre are interrelated as Arazi should do land Tasfia ( clearance) and cadastre's job is surveying, so without surveying of land Arazi can't start land Tasfia( clearance), so it was an important step that cadastre was merged with land authority directorate/ Arazi.
- Currently Arazi has 47 staff including cadastre staff.
- According to Mr.Sadiq, LARA conducted one week workshop about Land Management Law amendments and he attended that workshop, he says "we are happy from those amendments, all these amendments are acceptable and they are positive changes in LML", Moreover, LARA conducted two other workshops about *Tasfia* (land clearance) procedures, land leasing procedures and archiving surveys. In addition to above workshops, LARA provided ARAZI office with some computers, desks and printers when LARA was going to close its East office.
- Mr.Sadiq was unaware of upgrading and formalization process of Campoona and Araban informal settlements as he said because these settlements are located inside the city, LARA might coordinated its work with municipality or DUDA not with Arazi.
- He described the land transfer and clearance procedures by stating that whenever any governmental land is going to be cleared and transferred to a governmental entity or to someone else, an evaluation committee consisted of *Mastofiat* ( the finance and revenue department), cadastre, Department of MAIL, Governor office, Mining department, Department of Urban Development and Municipality is evaluating the land and after their evaluation , the Arazi fill form No: 1, and send it to the Cabinet of



Ministers and after their approval and signing of the president the land is transferred to the new governmental entity or anyone else who requested the land to be transferred to him.

- At the middle of the meeting Mr.Habibullah head of cadastre department joined the meeting, he said I am aware of cadastre survey which was done by Geo Planning firm, he added that cadastre department introduced four of its technical staff to voluntarily help Geo Planning in conducting survey in Araban and Campoona, but he said after the survey finished , he didn't receive any maps, survey documents only one CD or hard disk he received from LARA which he doesn't know what was in it and he sent it to central/Kabul cadastre department, he couldn't use the disk or hard drive. Moreover, he said the four technical staff of cadastre received some training from Geo Planning prior to start of survey and during the survey on using GPS.
- Mr. Habibullah said, the cadastre department needs more staff, training of staff on GPS, Trimble, GIS and other new technological equipment, which are used for survey proposes, as well as it needs vehicles and drivers as they currently don't have any vehicles.
- The head of Arazi Mr. Sadiq said we need building for Arazi offices in Jalalabad, training center as we want to train the east provinces' staff in Jalalabad instead of sending them to Kabul, we also need vehicles and drivers to visit governmental lands and protect it from grabbing.
- The head of cadastre was insisting that the land surveys should be done by governmental cadastre surveyors as the private sector surveyors may involve in corruption but after discussing with evaluation team he agreed if the cadastre has strong supervising role and control over private sector on that time the private firms can conduct cadastre surveys.

**MEETING REPORT 13**  
**CAMPOONA WOMEN’S SHURA**

**Date:** 2 Nov, 2014                      Starting Time: 9:00  
**Reporter:** Mussarat Arif                      Place (organization and address): Campona Jalalabad

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)  
Women Shura, Campoona (six women)

**LARA Eval Team attending** (circle): Mussarat Arif

**Meeting Objective(s)**  
FGD with Campoona Shura to evaluate LARA work

**Agenda** (*Attached: No*)

**Discussion**

The women’s shura has no awareness of LARA and its work. The head of village women confirmed that LARA had done nothing for women in Campoona. No formal meeting or discussion took place. We had a general discussion and conversation in which I found women have no real property ownership in Campoona, and everything is filled after their husband’s names in the court. Women believe that widows have no rights to their husband’s property. Women have no idea about inheritance, or if they have the right to receive their portion from in-laws family or from their father’s legacy.

LARA planned excellent work for women in Campoona, but we found they did not implement any of those campaigns for women in Campoona regarding awareness of women’s land rights in Afghan and Sharia law.

According to the women, men treat them nicely when they are pregnant. They have no plans for kids; the men don’t care how much a woman suffers with children delivery, and they demand their women bear as many children as they can. A couple never discusses this issue and men have high demand of kids.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

- USAID(??)

**Documents or resources required**

- LARA Gender work in Campoona, LARA annual report

**Misc. Notes**

**CC:** Aimee Rose

**MEETING REPORT 14**  
**DUDA JALALABAD**

**Date** : November 5<sup>th</sup> 2014

**Starting Time:** 11:30 AM

**Reporter:** Basir, Arif

**Place:** DUDA Office in Jalalabad

**Attendee:** Eng. Aminullah, Deputy Director

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Arif, Basir, Mussarat

**Meeting Objective(s):** discuss the role DUDA plays in informal settlements

- LARA provided 22 days of GIS training for some staff of DUDA, ARAZI, Municipality of Jalalabad. The trainees were provided with a training manual, and the deputy director of DUDA himself participated in the training. He said although the training was good, they needed more practical training than theoretical.
- The LARA project renovated some offices of DUDA, and installed solar power to provide them with power when the city power was off.
- He was not aware of the software ALRMIS or OpenTitle.
- The DUDA has only one surveyor right now, and DUDA needs more surveyors and to train them in GIS and other new technological equipment.
- He said that whenever DUDA wants to survey or make a plan for an area, they ask the cadastral staff to inform them on the cadastral information of the land and afterwards they start the actual planning, he suggested that if the cadastral maps were merged with planning maps of DUDA and the title deeds of the courts as unified cadastre maps, that would streamline and ease the work of DUDA and prevent the waste of time going back and forth to different governmental entities.
- Many organizations work for land but unfortunately there is not a single hub for communication to coordinate all the activities related to land so, what we have is a waste of resources and the responsibilities, having to go through a chain that creates conflict between departments.
- In Jalalabad, there are only two industrial parks, Hesar-i-Shahi and Shiekh Misry, and he wasn't aware of any feasibility study done by LARA about any industrial parks.

The head of DUDA might have much information, but Jalalabad DUDA was not involved in LARA's activities.

- He explained that warlords and land mafia are big obstacles for city planning and development, as these warlords grab and seize any land allocated to city planning and they don't allow DUDA to implement its plans according to city's deployment plans. He said without the strong political will of the government to prevent land grabbing, the land grabbers will not allow DUDA to implement its city plans.
- He wished that President Ashraf Ghani and the international community will work to stop the land grabbing.

**MEETING REPORT 15  
GEOPLANNING COMPANY (PRIVATE CONTRACTOR)**

**Date** October 19 2014 :  
**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Starting Time: 10:00AM  
Place : Villa 3 Checchi

**Attendees: GEO PLANNING COMPANY**

geoplanningcompany@gmail.com  
Karte 4, Third District, Uroj Computer Plaza, Fourth Floor, apt.  
80, Kabul, Afghanistan  
House #96<sup>th</sup>, Street#5, Phase#1, Jalalabad, Afghanistan

ZAHER SULTANI 93 (0) 705168815  
Zaher.Sultani@yahoo.com  
JAWED RAHIMI 93 (0) 787872000

**LARA Evaluation Team : BASIR, BRUNET**

Meeting Objective(s): GeoPlanning did the cadastral land survey work for the two pilot projects on informal settlements in Jalalabad.

**Discussion: FINDINGS**

- GeoPlanning Company got a contract from LARA before the pilot projects were issued to train ARAZI personnel on the use of survey equipment like GPS and Total Station. GeoPlanning Company bid on the job in Jalalabad and won. The job was issued by LARA.
- That cadastral survey took six months to complete and used forty technicians.
- They received their scope of the work to be done from the LARA GROUP during a two-day instruction session. This project was the first cadastral project in Afghanistan in 13 years. There are around 50 land surveying firms in Afghanistan.
- A Land Surveyor in Afghanistan is a graduate from Kabul Polytechnic University with a B.Sc. Degree in surveying after 4 years. There is no association of Land Surveyors in private practice in Afghanistan.
- The cadastral maps produced on this project were sent to LARA. These maps were produced at the scale of 1:1000. The unique identifier for the lot parcels was an odd number like CC 2 H 100. The orthographic photos used on this project were not accurate and dated from 2007.

- According to GeoPlanning, ARAZI personnel do not have the skills and expertise in the new surveying technology. ARAZI personnel are not using the land registration software OPEN-TITLE. In the process of obtaining social information of the property ARAZI should include at the same time a census of the habitants of the household.

### **CONCLUSIONS:**

- ARAZI should publish cadastral standards and regulations to be used in the land survey of informal settlements.
- The unique parcel identifier should be of the form of 7 digits with no letters.
- The future cadastral maps could be done using only a centroid of the visual property from the ortho-photo, instead of giving the dimensions of the parcels. This would be sufficient to generate a new cadaster for informal settlements; it would be less costly and could be done more rapidly.
- An association of private sector land surveyors should be formed in to implement and discuss different issues that affect the land surveying profession in Afghanistan.
- ARAZI should concentrate more on the administration of the cadastre in terms of regulations and issuing of standards, rather than the technicalities in the operation of the survey instruments.
- There should be regular meetings between the Survey Department of the Kabul Polytechnic University, ARAZI and the surveyors in private practice to inform on the different aspects of land surveying and the cadastre in Afghanistan.

**MEETING REPORT 16**  
**IDLG – KABUL**

**Date** : 25 Oct 2014  
**Reporter:** Allen Decker

Starting Time: 9:30am  
Place (organization and address):  
IDLG (Kabul office)

**Attendees** (check contact info and list organizations)

- Mr. Popal, General Director IDLG
- Ahmad Farid Azizi,

**LARA Eval Team attending**( circle): Decker, Brunet, Biser, Arif

**Meeting Objective(s)**

Introductory meeting to review LARA work with IDLG

**Agenda** (*Attached: No*)

**Discussion**

Director Popal initiated our discussion by reminding us that 70% of urban Afghan settlement was informal. Although IDLG was the original partner with LARA, there was a serious lack of coordination with the other entities after the initial phases of the project. Good work was done in Nangahar, but there was little coordination nationally. The project was an excellent concept, but was very slow in beginning, whereas the final phases of the project were very rushed. IDLG expected that Lara would identify the plot and do the mapping, register the plots with the city and establish the payment of *safai* tax. LARA did upgrading improvement, which the city could not do. MUDA was to do the land use planning. New legal vehicles would provide for replication, and the courts would handle registration.

Popul noted that the process was still incomplete and complained that there was no “lessons learned” workshop. LARA had a successful launch , but results were not coordinated for a rollout, and the focus of leadership was lost. Maps should have been handed over to the city. IDLG does not understand the role of Arazi, or the model or strategy for implementing it. Arazi has nothing to do with urban land (!). City boundaries were needed for MUDA and for the census and elections. The model for formalization cannot go forward with this ambiguity and in the absence of lessons learned.

IDLG had success in working with UN/Habitat and with RampUP, although RampUp experienced up to 30% errors in describing plots. LARA was to do the mapping and upgrading. Director Popol complained that he had little contact with LARA COPs, and that he was unaware of how LARA’s funding was allocated.

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

- Meeting with IDLG trainees to be arranged with Azizi

**Documents or resources required**

Review the MOUs with IDLG, MUDA and Arazi and AGCHO;

**Misc. Notes**

Even allowing for organizational rivalries, there seems to be substantial disconnect in the relationship of LARA with IDLG and lack of knowledge regarding LARA's outcomes.

**CC: SUPPORT II**



**MEETING REPORT 17**  
**SURVEY DEPARTMENT AT KABUL POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY**

**Date** : October 26<sup>th</sup> 2014

**Starting Time:** 9:00AM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

**Place :** Kabul Polytechnic University

**Attendees:** Mohammad Anwar Saraj (Director of Survey Department)

[anwarsaraj@gmail.com](mailto:anwarsaraj@gmail.com)

Zaher Sultani (professor in GIS & GPS)

[Zaher.sultani@Yahoo.com](mailto:Zaher.sultani@Yahoo.com)

+93 (0) 705168815

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Basir, Brunet

**Meeting Objective:** To know a little bit more about the Survey Department and its interaction with ARAZI

**FINDINGS:**

The Survey Department at the Polytechnic University was established in 1979. They teach Geodesy, GIS, Engineering Surveying and Cadastre. They have a staff of 14 professors. They present a four-year degree, and the enrollment is around 250 students. Around 40 students graduate each year and they all find employment mainly with the private practice. Starting salary is around \$12,000/year.

The University has a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with AGCHO concerning hiring students for their training, but there is a MOU underway with the Cadastral Department of ARAZI.

They are not aware that the Land Management Law is being modified and will include a new law on the Cadastre.

LARA paid to have a classroom repainted and a new floor was installed, but the computers that were promised never materialized.

They have four TRIMBLE GPS Stations and four Total Stations for the use of their students. They are not aware that there was another pilot project on informal settlements done by UNHABITAT in Kandahar.

**CONCLUSIONS:**

The Survey Department at Kabul Polytechnic University is the only organization capable of offering training to the personnel of the Cadastral Department at Arazi on the use of the new technology to be used on urban surveys. It is imperative that this training takes place,

otherwise the information generated by the Jalalabad survey project will never be incorporated in the National Cadastral Framework. All that effort would have been done for nothing.

**MEETING REPORT 18**  
**FINAL MEETING WITH LARA**

**Date** : October 21st 2014

**Starting Time:** 9:30AM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet,

**Place:** LARA OFFICE

**Attendees:** Nigel Thomson (LARA COP), Habibullah Hotak (Senior Legal Specialist), Rahim Gul (Monitoring and Evaluation)

**LARA Evaluation Team:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective:** Final meeting before LARA departs for Vermont

**FINDINGS:**

Nigel Thomson is leaving Kabul on October 23<sup>rd</sup>. 2014

The program ALRMIS (Afghanistan Land Records Management Information System) was initiated by LARA and implemented by Thomson-Reuters. ARAZI did not like the final product and asked for modifications to be made to the software. The changes to be made did not make sense to Thomson-Reuters and disagreements followed. Mr. Piekar is not responding to the emails sent by Thomson-Reuters.

Open Title is the software in use for the formalization of informal settlements and cannot be modified unless the author approves. It is functioning very well.

It is the opinion of Habibullah Hotak that all informal settlements will receive title to the land they occupy disregarding the type of title they provided during the social/economy survey.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Nigel Thompson feels he would need one more year to really finalize the project. On the other hand, he is confident that the main goals of the project were achieved by establishing security of tenure for the informal settlers.



**MEETING REPORT 20  
MUNICIPALITY OF JALALABAD**

**Date** : November 5<sup>th</sup> 2014

**Starting Time:** 10:00 AM

**Reporter:** Basir

**Place:** Municipality of Jalalabad

**Attendee:** Eng. Hakimudin Omar Khil, Deputy Mayor

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Arif, Basir

**Meeting Objective(s):** To have an overview of the survey of informal settlements

- The Deputy Mayor of Jalalabad said we are happy with the upgrading work done in both of the Araban and Compoona informal settlements, because before the upgrading process the residents of both settlements were living in very miserable conditions, the roads were unpaved, there were no sewage, if someone was sick it was not possible to send ambulance to the homes. After the upgrading done by LARA, the roads paved, drainage system and culverts were built, and now the inhabitants of these settlements can easily drive their car to their homes and benefit from other upgrading work which brought a big change to their lives.
- LARA provided GIS training for several municipality staff as well as computer trainings, moreover LARA renovated the Revenue departments' buildings.
- The Deputy Mayor said the model of LARA's pilot project is a good one and can be replicated in other informal settlements. He emphasized on both the community and municipality's role and participation in upgrading of informal settlements and said even in Araban and Campoona community fully participated in upgrading process as the residents willingly provided part of their land along the roads for the purpose of widening of the roads and municipality and collected the demolished materials and other materials which remained alongside the roads after the construction of the roads.
- He has not received the survey maps or documents produced by Geo Planning, as he wasn't working in municipality on that time.
- The Municipality's annual revenues are 200 million Afghanis.
- In terms of recommendation for future projects, he said the municipality is in dire need of the following:
  1. Assistance in trash process, as they want help in conveying of trash, burying trash and processing to turn it into fertilizer.
  2. Machinery like trucks, loaders, etc.

3. Hiring 500-700 workers to help us in cleaning of drainages, streams, which are full of dirty and filthy things. These workers should clean these drainages on weekly basis.
  4. An asphalt unit for paving damaged roads and re-asphalting them from time.
  5. Building parks, planting trees and paving the streets in order to avoid pollution.
- He recommended that instead of spending much money in administrative issues and meetings, it would be good to spend those moneys directly in the field and upgrading sites.

### **CONCLUSION:**

If the Municipality had a plan to bring in all informal settlements into a legal framework, the Municipality's shortage of funds would not be so acute. Indeed, registration and services fees could support the infrastructure needed by the city, as well as substantial upgrading work needed by the communities to be formalized.

**MEETING REPORT 21**

**RAMPUP EAST**

**Date** : November 9<sup>th</sup> 2014

Starting Time: 2:00 PM

**Reporter** : Michel Brunet

Place : RAMPUP OFFICE

**Attendee: Eng. Hedayatullah Dir.**

Regional Afghanistan Program for Urban Population (RAMPUP)

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective: What was the RAMPUP project in Jalalabad?**

**Findings:**

The idea of the project was to formalize businesses in Jalalabad. The Municipality of Jalalabad did not have the resources to carry out this work. The project lasted 4 years from June 2010 till March 2014.

A yearly fee of \$10.00 was levied on the businesses recruited. The Municipality's employees were trained to carry this work in the future. They were given computers and procedures.

It is estimated that 90% of the businesses were informal. Businesses would prefer to pay the municipality a yearly fee instead of paying the warlords.

The data collected was sent to the Municipality of Jalalabad and incorporated in a GIS system that gave the location of each new business.

**Discussion**

**Follow-up** (with person responsible)

**Documents or resources required**

**Misc. Notes**

**MEETING REPORT 22**  
**TERRA INSTITUTE**

**Date** : October 22<sup>nd</sup> 2014

**Starting Time:** 10:00AM

**Reporter:** Michel brunet

**Place :** Villa 3 Checchi

**Attendee:** Yasin Safar  
Cadastral Surveyor  
TERRA INSTITUTE – Kabul  
0799218611  
Yasin.safar@gmail.com

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker Brunet Basir Arif

**Meeting Objective:** His view on the informal surveys conducted in Jalalabad.

**FINDINGS:**

Mr. Safar gave us a long history of cadastral surveys in Afghanistan. Mr. Safar participated in the preparation to the modification of the new Cadastral Law. This new law will permit among other things to permit the cadastral surveys to be done by private firms.

AGCHO (Cadastre) was not consulted on the survey to be done for informal settlements in Jalalabad. The results from that survey were not sent to the cadastral office and surely will not conform to their standards.

**CONCLUSION:**

If ARAZI Cadastre is the organization responsible for the cadastre in Afghanistan, they will have to be consulted in any new surveys to be done on informal settlements and the standards to be used to carry out those surveys.



**MEETING REPORT 23**  
**UN HABITAT**

**Date** : October 27<sup>th</sup> 2014

Starting Time: 9:30AM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Place : UN HABITAT

**Attendee: Eng. Mohammad Rahman**

National Project Manager

UN-HABITAT, Afghanistan

House #235, Street#7 Taimani, Kabul, AFG

[Mohammad.rahman@unhabitat-afg.org](mailto:Mohammad.rahman@unhabitat-afg.org)

+93 (0) 700285081

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting objectives:** To learn about ongoing UN-HABITAT projects in Afghanistan.

**FINDINGS:**

The prime counterpart in Afghanistan for UN-HABITAT is IDLG (Independent Directorate of Local Governance). It is the responsibility of the municipality where the work takes place to coordinate the different activities of the projects.

They have two ongoing projects right now that will be finished in December 2014, one in Jalalabad and the other one in Kabul. These were three year projects. Those projects always reflect the following scenario:

- Of prime importance on all those projects is the establishment of a Community Development Council. One for the women and one for the men; the two councils have to agree on priorities for the development.
- Prepare an action plan from the set of priorities.
- Land surveys, topography, drainage, etc.
- MOU with the municipalities
- Training of persons involved.

According to Mr. Rahman, the only informal settlement to receive title deed at the end of the project was the one done in Kandahar, where the president intervened with a presidential decree. On all the other projects, the best that could be done was to establish security of tenure.

The mechanism for titling should be given to ARAZI in the future. There were no cadastral maps or registration done on those two above mentioned projects. Mr. Rahman, does not seem to know that AZARI has a mandate for urban as well as for rural lands.

UN-HABITAT has other ongoing projects on Community Based Municipal Supports in Jalalabad and Herat, which deal with cadastre and land registration. We were given the name of the contact person.

Another project for 2015 they are working on, deals with formalization of settlements for Internal Displaced Persons (IDP) within Afghanistan.

**CONCLUSION:**

From that meeting it is obvious that UN-HABITAT gives the Community Participation or Involvement a top priority of their projects. For them, it is of prime importance.

**MEETING REPORT 24  
JALALABAD URBAN COURT**

**Date** : 5 November 2014

**Starting Time:** 10:00 AM

**Reporter:** Basir

**Place:** Jalalabad Urban Court

**Attendee:** **Judge Mohammad Rahim**  
Presiding Judge, Jalalabad Urban Court

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective(s): Procedure used by the Court to register documents**

- The Head of Urban Court of Jalalabad Judge Mohammad Rahim is happy from LARA's assistance with Deed court, because he said that LARA's work with the Deed court eased and speeded up the procedures of finding deeds in achieve. Thanks to LARA's help, now we can find a deed in few minutes instead of days.
- He described the process of issuing title deeds to State Lands as follows:  
First, the Municipality should map the land, than the MUDA accept and include it in its planning, afterwards the municipality determine price for each parcel and the buyer pays that price to the municipality and municipality send a letter to the governor office, the governor office send the letter to the court, then the court issues title deed to the buyer. We mention in the deed that the governor as representative of the government is seller and the person who pays the price is buyer.
- The judge described, we don't issue any title deed until the land clearance process is finished, because first we want to know whether the land belongs to state or to a person, we don't want to issue the title deeds to state land until the above mentioned process is completed and through this way we want to prevent land grabbing.
- The Judge said “ LARA digitized the last five years' title deeds and provided computers, trainings to archive staff and renovated covers of decayed registration books”
- He suggested that any coming USAID projects should try to integrate the maps of cadastre the municipality's registration books with the title deeds registration in software.
- He opposed that title deeds will be issued by ARAZI or any other organization, because he said according to the law on structures and competencies of courts it is the sole responsibility of the courts to issue title deeds, moreover he said the title deeds need familiarity with strong legal terminologies which only judges who are graduated from Law or Sharia faculties understand and know those terminologies, furthermore he said that people's trust on courts are higher than other governmental entities as courts issue title deeds under the supervision of three judges which minimize the chances of corruption compare to other organizations where the head of the organization issues orders only by himself which increase the chance of corruption.

**MEETING REPORT 25  
WORLD BANK**

**Date** : November 9<sup>th</sup> 2014

Starting Time: 4:00 PM

**Reporter:** Michel Brunet

Place: World Bank Office

**Attendee: Asta Olesen**

Senior Social Development Specialist

House 19, street 15

Wazir Akbar Khan

Kabul, Afghanistan

[aolesen@worldbank.org](mailto:aolesen@worldbank.org)

+93 (0) 70 1133399

**LARA Evaluation Team attending:** Decker, Brunet, Basir

**Meeting Objective:** To discover if ARAZI can expect support for a future land program for Afghanistan through the World Bank.

**Findings:**

The World Bank participated on the amendments to the Land Management Law and also on the Land Acquisition Law, using an expert from India. They also hired a consultant to develop the new Strategy for ARAZI. They are preparing a new program to support ARAZI on a number of issues such as Land Registration, facilitate the registration of deeds from informal settlements and aid to the Survey Department.

Mrs. Olesen is fully aware that the Survey Department at ARAZI needs upgrading because the personnel was trained at the old Survey School in Kandahar and never had the chance to use the new technology. They have been into discussion with USAID to recover unused money (\$4 million) from the LARA project to be transferred to the World Bank.

They are aware of the problems with the ALRMIS software and were instrumental in sending an IT expert from FAO to review that software and others being used at ARAZI.

Mrs. Olesen was not impressed by the training center in operation at ARAZI. She was appalled that another study was done on an Industrial Park in Jalalabad, when the Bank's own findings did not support because of the lack of adequate power to that site.

On the gender issue, and the women legal rights to the land, the inheritance Sharia laws in Afghanistan are still a problem and difficult to be implemented. She emphasized on coordination between donors to avoid repetition of similarities in conducting projects.

**Conclusion:**

It appears that the World Bank is proceeding with a plan to follow up on the LARA project and continue its support to ARAZI.

**Cecchi and Company Consulting, Inc.**  
**Afghanistan SUPPORT-II Project**  
**Wazir Akbar Khan**  
**Kabul, Afghanistan**